
1 Guiding principles for the development and application of solid phase
2 phosphorus-adsorbents for freshwater ecosystems

3 G.B. Douglas^{a*}, D.P. Hamilton^b, M.S. Robb^c, G. Pan^d, B.M.Spears^e and M. Lurling^f

4 *a) CSIRO Land and Water, Centre for Environment and Life Sciences, Floreat, Western Australia, Australia*

5 *b) University of Waikato, Hamilton, New Zealand*

6 *c) Western Australian Department of Water, Perth, Western Australia, Australia*

7 *d) Research Center for Eco-Environmental Sciences, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Haidian District, Beijing, China*

8 *e) Centre for Ecology and Hydrology, Penicuik, Midlothian, Scotland, UK*

9 *f) Department of Environmental Sciences, Wageningen University, P.O. Box 47, 6700 AA Wageningen, The Netherlands*

10 *Corresponding author

11 Dr Grant Douglas

12 Senior Principal Research Scientist

13 CSIRO Land and Water Flagship

14 Private Bag 5, Wembley, WA

15 6913

16 Australia

17 Email: grant.douglas@csiro.au

18 Phone: +61 8 9333 6131

19

20

21 Abstract

22 While a diverse array of phosphorus (P)-adsorbent materials is currently available for application to
23 freshwater aquatic systems, selection of the most appropriate P-adsorbents remains problematic. In
24 particular, there has to be a close correspondence between attributes of the P-adsorbent, its field
25 performance, and the management goals for treatment. These management goals may vary from a
26 rapid reduction in dissolved P to address seasonal enrichments from internal loading, targeting
27 external fluxes due to anthropogenic sources, or long term inactivation of internal P inventories
28 contained within bottom sediments. It also remains a challenge to develop new methods and materials
29 that are ecologically benign and cost-effective. We draw on evidence in the literature and the authors'
30 personal experiences in the field, to summarise the attributes of a range of P-adsorbent materials. We
31 offer 'guiding principles' to support practical use of existing materials and outline key development
32 needs for new materials.

33

34 Keywords

35 nutrients; phosphorus adsorptive materials; guidelines; application

36

37

38 1. Introduction

39 Persistent eutrophication is a response to nutrient enrichment that often arises from anthropogenic
40 modifications to catchments of freshwater systems (Smith 2003; Oliveira and Machado 2013;
41 Zamparas and Zacharias 2014). The deleterious effects of eutrophication may include: changes in
42 phytoplankton community structure, often leading to blooms of toxin-producing species, loss of
43 aquatic habitat, fish kills, large releases of phosphorus (P) from bed sediments associated with anoxia,
44 degradation of water quality, and loss of visual and social amenity (e.g. Nikolai and Dzialowski 2014).

45 There is vigorous debate about the role of nitrogen (N) and P in limiting phytoplankton biomass in
46 order to control eutrophication in freshwater systems. In the context of the applications of P adsorbent
47 materials we provide a brief overview of this debate. Schindler et al. (2008) used a 37-year study on
48 Lake 227 (Ontario, Canada) to conclude that P reduction should be the focus of efforts to manage
49 eutrophication. The central tenet of their argument was that N fixation by cyanobacteria made up for
50 N deficits at the system (lake) scale. Several subsequent publications have reinforced this viewpoint
51 (Schindler 2008; Carpenter 2008; Patterson et al. 2011; Schindler 2012). Alternatively, Scott and
52 McCarthy (2011) disputed the analysis of data that led to the original conclusions of Schindler et al.
53 (2008) and a number of authors present arguments that N deficits are not necessarily compensated for
54 by N-fixing cyanobacteria in eutrophic systems (e.g., Howarth and Paerl 2008; Conley et al. 2009).
55 The proliferation of N-fixing cyanobacteria is often associated with the presence of anoxia in bottom
56 waters, which enhances both P release from bottom sediments and N losses from denitrification (e.g.,
57 Downing and McCauley 1992, Dodds et al. 2002; Smith 2003; Ma et al. 2015), resulting in low water
58 column N:P ratios (e.g. Bergstrom et al. 2015).

59 What is clear is that effective eutrophication management demands that both external supply as well
60 as internally stored nutrients be tackled (Cooke et al. 2005). The latter has been most effectively
61 achieved by the application of P adsorbent materials. In many cases phytoplankton growth limitation
62 cannot be attributed solely to one nutrient, and co-limitation or switches in the limiting nutrient have
63 been observed amongst different phytoplankton assemblages (e.g. Burger et al. 2007; Muller and
64 Mitrovic 2014), over time scales such as seasons (Muhid and Burford 2012; Kolzau et al. 2014;

65 Trochine et al. 2014, Xu et al. 2015) or with location within a single system (Abell et al. 2014). Here
66 we recall Liebig's barrel – a barrel illustration published in 1903 by Hans Arnold von Dobeneck –
67 which visualizes that once the limitation of one element is lifted, another element becomes limiting
68 (Gröger 2010). Indeed, it is obvious that dual N and P enrichment can boost phytoplankton biomass
69 more than only single N or P addition. Put simply, all elements are needed in abundance to supply the
70 building blocks necessary for sustaining phytoplankton production. If stores remain sufficiently
71 elevated for a period of time, the consequence will be eutrophication. It is not necessary to control all
72 the nutrients that are in abundance. In fact, it is efficient to control only one element to prevent
73 excessive phytoplankton proliferation and blooms. Mitigation aimed at the external nutrient supply,
74 unfortunately, may not be especially effective in the short-term because of the need to mitigate
75 legacies of nutrients in the bottom sediments.

76 In many cases, internal loading of nutrients from bottom sediments may be sufficient to support
77 elevated phytoplankton biomass and delay return to an earlier pre-eutrophication state (Marsden 1989;
78 Jeppensen et al. 2005). The nutrient inventory contained within bottom sediments can be substantial,
79 and a sustained reduction in nutrients derived from both internal and external loading, is generally
80 required, irrespective of seasonal or persistent N, P or N+P limitation. Xu et al. (2015) suggest that
81 reducing nutrients to below a threshold concentration can still be cost-effective and manageable even
82 when it may not be possible to restore a system to its pre-human-impact status (i.e. reference state)
83 because of such legacies. Specifically, they claim that “61–71% TN and 20–46% TP reduction are
84 necessary to bring [Lake] Taihu's phytoplankton biomass to “acceptable” sub-bloom conditions of
85 less than $20 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ chlorophyll-a”. Such reductions are already challenging in themselves, but in 2009
86 atmospheric N deposition in Jiangsu province (where Taihu is located) was $4890 \text{ kg N km}^{-2} \text{ year}^{-1}$
87 (Han et al. 2014). Consequently, the $11,000 \text{ tonnes N year}^{-1}$ from atmospheric deposition is substantial
88 in relation to the estimated $46,000 \text{ tonnes N year}^{-1}$ derived from river inflows (Xu et al. 2015).
89 Therefore, it seems highly unlikely that the suggested N load reduction can be realized. In contrast, P
90 control may be more feasible. The bioavailability of P can be reduced to a point where it limits algal
91 growth (Douglas et al. in press; Waajen et al. in press). This inactivation can be accomplished through

92 formation of salts with varying degrees of solubility, including with aluminium, calcium, iron,
93 lanthanum or other metals, while such immobilization for nitrogen is generally not possible. Also,
94 based on its relative abundance in phytoplankton and in water, P-reduction is the single logical target;
95 the Redfield ratio (P:N:C is 1:16: 106) shows that P limitation is likely to be stoichiometrically the
96 most efficient mechanism to achieve limitation as ratios of P:C in the water are generally considerably
97 lower than the Redfield ratio.

98 Addressing P legacies is critical (e.g., Jarvie et al. 2014), and could be aided by the development of a
99 “tool box” of complimentary nutrient mitigation or intervention strategies. A major component of this
100 tool box may be the use of solid-phase P-adsorptive¹ or flocculation materials to reduce bioavailable P
101 concentrations, either directly in the water column or indirectly via reductions in P release from the
102 bottom sediments to the overlying water. Use of P-adsorptive materials is one of the commonly
103 deployed ‘geoengineering’ approaches (*sensu* MacKay et al. 2014) to manage internal nutrient
104 loading. In this review we examine current applications of a range of solid-phase P-adsorptive
105 materials and discuss guiding principles for their development and application in freshwater
106 ecosystems. We acknowledge the development of these materials is rapid and will therefore not
107 provide a complete coverage of all P-adsorptive materials. Instead we focus on those with an
108 established body of laboratory and/or field based evidence.

109 Over the past 50 years, a range of amendments has been applied to freshwater aquatic systems in an
110 attempt to manage internal P loading on an intra- to inter-annual basis (Douglas et al. 2004). Initially,
111 dissolved chemical reagents were directly applied to a waterbody, and most commonly included alum
112 or Al-containing compounds and nitrate-containing compounds that are briefly discussed here as a
113 prelude to the discussion on solid P-adsorbents.

¹ For consistency we have used the term “P-adsorptive” throughout to describe P-uptake, however, it is recognised that many materials may be either P-adsorbents (surface complexation/binding or precipitation) or P-absorbents (internal/intra-particle binding), or a combination thereof when more than one mechanism is operative. It is also recognised that the nature of P-uptake and occupancy/speciation, particle size or association may change over time (e.g. due to processes such as internal diffusion, crystal overgrowths or Ostwald ripening).

114 The use of alum to reduce concentrations of soluble phosphorus in aquatic systems appears to have
115 been first suggested by Lund (1955), with the first documented application occurring in a Swedish
116 lake (Jernelov 1971). Since that time alum or similar aluminium based amendments (*e.g.* aluminium
117 hydroxide, Browman et al. 1977) have been applied to a number of aquatic systems, in particular lakes
118 in North America (*e.g.* Cooke and Welch 1993) in an attempt to control both algal and macrophyte
119 biomass (*e.g.* Haumann and Waite 1978; Wolter 1994). These applications continue in both Europe
120 and North America despite concerns over toxicity associated with either the application or the re-
121 release of applied Al (Reitzel et al. 2013) or changes in ecosystem function (*e.g.* Nogaro et al. 2013).

122 An alternative to alum has been the use of nitrate salts, most often ferric nitrate or calcium nitrate
123 injected into bottom sediments to increase redox status (via nitrate) and provide P-binding metal
124 cations (Fe or Ca). This technique was initially developed in the mid 1970s (Ripl, 1976, 1994; Ripl
125 and Lindward 1978) as a method to oxidise the upper layers of bottom sediments using calcium
126 nitrate. The calcium nitrate injection technique which is also known under various commercial names
127 *e.g.* 'Riplox' (Europe) and 'Limnofix' (North America), has been applied to a number of lakes,
128 particularly in Europe (*e.g.* Bjork 1988; Søndergaard et al. 2000; Yamada et al. 2012) with varying
129 degrees of success.

130

131 **2. A brief review of P-adsorptive materials for application in freshwater aquatic systems**

132 Several studies document different P-adsorptive materials and techniques that may be used to bind P
133 in the water column or to intercept the P that might arise from internal loading, or scavenge dissolved
134 P from the water column (*e.g.* Robb et al. 2003; Douglas et al. 2004; Egemose et al. 2010, Gibbs et al.
135 2011, Pan et al. 2012; Spears et al. 2013). In general, P-adsorptive materials applied in standing
136 waters, including constructed wetlands, can be divided into four categories (Table 1, modified after
137 Douglas et al. 2004):

- 138 • naturally occurring minerals, soils, suspended particles or earth materials;
- 139 • natural or synthetically produced materials;

-
- 140 • modified clay mineral or soils; and
 - 141 • mining, mineral processing and industrial by-products.

142 Most P adsorbents with substantial uptake capacity are generally enriched in Ca, Fe and/or Al or a
143 combination thereof, however, it has also been demonstrated that rare earth elements, in particular
144 lanthanum (La), the most abundant, non-redox-sensitive rare earth element, may also form strong
145 associations with P (Firsching and Brune, 1991; Douglas 1997, 2002; Robb et al. 2002; Yuan et al.
146 2009). In the last decade, and nearly 20 years after the development of La-modified bentonite for P
147 adsorption, a large number of studies have sought to exploit the utility of La-modified materials or La-
148 bearing compounds to remove P from natural aquatic ecosystems (Table 1).

149 Interactions of Ca, Fe, Al or La-bearing materials with P may involve a number of geochemical
150 associations. These include the formation of discrete secondary minerals, ion exchange via surface
151 adsorption, internal ion exchange, or the formation of less well-defined associations such as complex
152 multi-component surface adsorption or precipitation processes (e.g. Booker et al., 1999; Douglas et al.
153 2004). Many of these associations may also change over time due to diffusion or recrystallization.
154 Confounding the uptake of P, however, may be the presence of interfering species including simple
155 (e.g. carbonate) or complex polyelectrolyte anions (e.g. dissolved organic carbon). A detailed
156 summary (modified after Douglas et al. 2004) of the four main groups of P-adsorbent materials is
157 given below and in Table 1.

158 *2.1. Naturally occurring minerals, soils, suspended particles or earth materials*

159 **2.1.1 Carbonates**

160 A range of carbonates including limestone, dolomite and magnesite has been investigated for the
161 uptake of P from natural and wastewaters (Shilton et al.2005; Karaca et al.2006; Mateus et al. 2012;
162 Jaouadi et al. 2013; Xu et al. 2014). As a consequence, carbonates or lime have been extensively
163 tested in the removal of soluble P from both natural (e.g. rivers: Jack and Platell 1983; Futaedianiet et
164 al. 1992, lakes or other impoundments: Prepaset et al. 1990) and waste waters (e.g. piggery effluents:
165 Takeuchi and Komada 1998), stormwaters (Babinet al. 1989), soils (Anderson et al. 1995), and

166 wetlands (Drizoet et al. 1999; Arias et al 2000; Vohla et al. 2011; Mateus et al. 2012). In addition to
167 carbonate, calcined derivatives such as partially calcined dolomite (Roques et al. 1991) and granular
168 magnesia clinker (Kaneko and Nakajima 1998; Suzuki and Fuji 1988) and calcined magnesia
169 (Wendling et al. 2012) have also been assessed as substrates for P removal.

170 **2.1.2 Soils, sands and suspended particles**

171 Phosphorus adsorption to soils, particularly in an agricultural context, has been the subject of
172 extensive research for a number decades (Bray and Kurtz 1945; Barrow 1970, 1999), however, a
173 more recent focus has been on the utilisation of these material to remove dissolved P from natural
174 and wastewaters (Arias et al. 2000; Degens et al. 2000; Kim et al. 2014; Dai and Pan 2014; Pan et al.
175 2002, 2013). A range of P uptake capacities reflect the mineralogical and physico-chemical
176 heterogeneity of the soils used. The most adsorptive soils are generally enriched in one or more of
177 Ca-, Fe- or Al- bearing mineral phases. Arias et al. (2000) concluded that Ca was the most important
178 parameter in determining P uptake by sands, presumably due to the precipitation of calcium P phases
179 including apatite, however, under more moderately acidic conditions Fe and Al were also important
180 in P-uptake and precipitation reactions. More recently, chitosan-modified soils or cationic starch
181 modified soils have been investigated, although the focus has been on the flocculation of
182 cyanobacteria (and P contained therein) in lakes (Pan et al. 2006, 2011; Shi et al., 2015). However, it
183 is likely that these chitosan-modified soils may also simultaneously remove substantial P (e.g. Chung
184 et al. 2005; Dai et al. 2011). A similar study focusing on the removal of cyanobacteria using
185 polyaluminium chloride (PAC) or chitosan and a red soil collected on the banks of a eutrophic
186 reservoir in Brazil showed P adsorption maxima of 3.0 mg P g⁻¹soil under oxic and 0.5 mg g⁻¹under
187 anoxic conditions in ultrapure water (Noyma et al. 2015).

188 *2.2. Natural or synthetically-produced materials*

189 **2.2.1. Allophane and imogolite**

190 Both allophane and imogolite occur in nature as secondary aluminosilicate minerals in soils (*e.g.*
191 Farmer and Russell 1990; Barrealet al. 2001; Moro et al. 2015) and can also be synthetically

192 produced (Wada 1989; Denaix et al. 1999). A high P-uptake capacity for allophane and imogolite has
193 been demonstrated in laboratory studies. Uptake can vary strongly as both a function of pH and
194 salinity. Optimal P-uptake is typically near pH6 while above pH9 P-uptake is minimal, with cation
195 uptake (e.g. Na, Ca) the predominant reaction (e.g. Wada 1959; 1980) as a result in changes in
196 surface charge with pH. Studies of the plant availability of P adsorbed to allophane suggest that the
197 initially adsorbed P, or that bound for an extended period, might not be bioavailable, although later-
198 bound P may become available (Parfitt et al. 1982, 1989). The ability of allophanic soils to retain P
199 has been documented by Degens et al. (2000). This study revealed that 91% of the P in a dairy
200 effluent applied to allophanic soils (ca. 1-12% allophane) over a period of 22 years was retained in a
201 75cm depth profile, with 81% retained within the upper 25cm.

202 **2.2.2. Fe-Al (oxy)hydroxides**

203 Numerous studies over many decades have documented the adsorption of P to both Fe- and Al-oxides
204 and (oxy)hydroxides in soils and sediments (Parfitt 1989; Goundaret et al. 2014; Bakenet et al. 2015) and
205 synthetically prepared materials (McLaughlin et al. 1981, Borggaard 1983, 1990). Some Fe- and Al-
206 oxides may also form a solid solution series such as Al in goethite, or amorphous oxides. In light of
207 this often close association of Fe and Al in nature, their mineralogical similarity and their common
208 evaluation as P adsorbents, Fe- and Al-oxides and oxyhydroxides are discussed together. The most
209 common Fe-oxides that occur in soils are goethite and ferrihydrite and both may contain significant
210 concentrations of other elements such as Al and Si, respectively. Many other types of oxide may also
211 occur in nature and as part of industrial wastes such as haematite and magnetite, which have a range
212 of P uptake capacities. Gibbsite is the most widely occurring Al-oxide in soils and bauxite deposits
213 (Hsu 1989). Studies of Fe- and Al-oxides in soils suggest that P is predominantly associated with Fe-
214 oxides at concentrations 4-20 times greater than that of Al-oxides (Norrish and Rosser 1983). In
215 contrast, comparative studies of the adsorption of P on synthetic Fe- and Al-oxides consistently
216 indicate that Al-oxides have a substantially higher P uptake capacity (e.g. Borggaard 1983). An
217 approximate order of P adsorption to Fe- and Al-oxide minerals is Al-gel > Fe-gel >>, haematite,
218 goethite, magnetite > gibbsite. This order of P adsorption may also be dependent on factors such as

219 particle size, age, drying, degree of crystallinity of particular minerals and pH, ionic strength, the
220 period of P adsorption and initial P concentration (*e.g.* Bolan et al. 1986). Iron oxides derived from
221 industrial processes such as the Bayer process (red mud) and mineral sand processing have also been
222 evaluated as P adsorbents (*e.g.* Douglas et al. 2012; Wendling et al. 2012, 2013).

223 **Hydrotalcites**

224 Hydrotalcites are layered double hydroxides most commonly formed by the co-precipitation of
225 divalent (*e.g.* Mg^{2+} , Fe^{2+}) and trivalent (Al^{3+} , Fe^{3+}) metal cation solutions at high pH (Taylor 1984;
226 Vucelic et al. 1997; Shin et al. 1996). Hydrotalcites occur naturally as accessory minerals in soils and
227 sediments, but may also be synthesised such as from industrial waste materials by the reaction of
228 bauxite residue (red mud) with seawater (*e.g.* Thornber and Hughes 1987), by the reaction of lime
229 with fly ash (*e.g.* Reardon and Della Valle 1997) or from wastewaters (Douglas 2014). A number of
230 studies have been conducted to investigate ways to exploit the anion exchange properties of
231 hydrotalcites. These studies have focussed on the removal of P and other oxyanions and humic
232 substances from natural and wastewaters (Miyata 1980; Misra and Perrotta 1992; Shin et al. 1996;
233 Seida and Nakano 2000). A major obstacle to the use of hydrotalcites for P removal in natural and/or
234 wastewaters is the selectivity for carbonate over P, with a selectivity series in the approximate order
235 $CO_3^{2-} > HPO_4^{2-} >> SO_4^{2-}$, $OH^- > F^- > Cl^- > NO_3^-$ (Miyata 1983; Shin et al. 1986; Cavani et al. 1991).
236 Many hydrotalcites are also synthesised with carbonate as the predominant anion and thus require
237 anion exchange before they can be used as P-adsorbents. When carbonate is also combined with
238 sulphate, nitrate and chloride (as might commonly occur in natural or wastewaters) the reduction of
239 P adsorption to the hydrotalcite is further decreased (Shin et al. 1996).

240 *2.3. Modified clay mineral or soils*

241 **2.3.1. Expanded/thermally treated clay aggregates**

242 Expanded clay aggregates, where clay interlayers are expanded or exfoliated via heating, have been
243 extensively investigated in laboratory and constructed wetland systems, to evaluate their potential for
244 P-uptake (*e.g.* Johansson et al. 1995). The P uptake capacity of expanded clay aggregates is mostly

245 determined by the Ca concentration (Zhu et al. 1997), with the adsorbed P probably precipitating as
246 hydroxyapatite (Zhu 1998). Alternatively, thermally-treated palygorskite has also been demonstrated
247 to be an effective P-adsorbent in aquatic systems (e.g. Gan et al, 2009; Yin et al., 2013).

248 **2.3.2. Rare earth modified clays, zeolites and soils**

249 Rare earth element (REE)-modified clays such as lanthanum (La)-modified bentonite were initially
250 developed in the 1990s as a method to remove dissolved P from the water column and also to form a
251 reactive layer of bottom sediments to intercept and bind P released from underlying sediments
252 (Douglas 2007, 2007; Douglas et al. 2004, 2008; Robb et al. 2003). Extensive laboratory testing
253 demonstrated that in the presence of a strong oxyanion such as P, a stable mineral ($\text{LaPO}_4 \cdot n\text{H}_2\text{O}$ –
254 rhabdophane) is formed (Douglas et al. 2000). This mineral is an analogue of other REE-P minerals
255 that were demonstrated to be resistant to weathering over geological time. Other studies suggested that
256 the newly precipitated rhabdophane is resistant to microbial attack from endemic sediment micro-
257 organisms at least in the short-term (days to months, Douglas et al. 1997). A study on sediments from
258 ten La-modified bentonite-treated lakes again demonstrated formation of rhabdophane (Douglas et al,
259 2000) and slow transition to the extremely stable mineral monazite (Dithmer et al. in press). Large-
260 scale field trials of lanthanum-modified clays suggest that they are effective in capturing a substantial
261 proportion of P released from bottom sediments when applied as a thin (*ca.* 1mm) reactive capping
262 (Douglas and Adeney 2001). Following on from the development of rare earth modified clays, similar
263 materials which incorporate lanthanum into an aluminosilicate matrix, including lanthanum modified
264 vermiculite, zeolite, and soils, have been synthesised and evaluated (Huang et al. 2014; Yuan et al.
265 2009; Ning et al. 2008).

266 *2.4. Mining, mineral processing and industrial by-products*

267 **2.4.1. Red mud/sand**

268 The global inventory of red mud is estimated to be in excess of 2.7 billion tonnes, with an annual
269 increment of 120 million tonnes (Klauber et al. 2009; Pontikes and Angelopoulos, 2013). Red mud
270 has frequently been demonstrated to bind P from effluent or in soils. The degree of adsorption may

271 be strongly affected by pH (*e.g.* see Barrow 1982) and the amount of gypsum added to the red mud
272 as an amendment. This high affinity for P reflects the presence of high concentrations of Fe-
273 oxyhydroxides and/or Al species in the red mud, although little research has been undertaken to
274 elucidate the exact mechanism of P retention. Extensive field and laboratory trials have been
275 conducted with native red mud (or amended derivatives). Red mud has also been tested for its ability
276 to reduce P from aqueous solutions (Shiao and Akashi 1977) and from drain water (Ho and Mathew
277 1993). An inherent characteristic of red mud is that it is strongly alkaline as a legacy of the Bayer
278 process and thus, is usually neutralised (amended) prior to experimental use. This treatment, most
279 frequently with gypsum, may significantly increase the P adsorption capacity of red mud. However,
280 red mud may also contain high concentrations of dissolved salts that may have to be removed for
281 particular applications by washing. In addition, untreated and/or amended red mud may contain
282 substantial concentrations of chemically leachable or water extractable P (Ho and Mathew 1993).
283 The mixing of red mud with seawater, the lowest cost and most readily available material for
284 neutralization, results in the formation of hydrotalcites (Thornber and Hughes 1987). Extensive
285 testing of red mud, and in particular seawater-neutralised red mud, indicates that it may have some
286 P-uptake capacity but this is often reduced in the presence of bicarbonate (*e.g.* Wang et al, 2008).

287 **2.4.2. Slags**

288 A range of slags as P absorbents, including blast furnace slag, and related slags such as basic oxygen
289 furnace (BOF) slag and electric arc furnace slag (EAF), has been investigated extensively over the
290 past three decades (Yamada et al. 1986; Baker et al. 1998; Johansson and Gustafsson 2000;
291 Wendling et al. 2012). Blast furnace slag may occur in both crystalline and amorphous forms and is
292 principally composed of silica, aluminium derived from the parent iron ore with appreciable Ca
293 derived from the flux. The large proportion of CaO, and sometimes MgO, results in an alkaline slag,
294 which may impart a pH of between *ca.* 8-11 in leachates (Proctor et al. 2000) and when used in
295 laboratory and field trials (*e.g.* Johansson 1999; Drizo et al. 2002). Possible applications that have
296 been investigated at either laboratory or field scale include the capture of P released from bottom
297 sediments (Yamada et al. 1987), and as a substrate to enhance the P uptake capacity of constructed

308 wetlands (*e.g.* Mann and Bavor 1993; Sakadevan and Bavor 1998). Most studies have identified the
309 formation of Ca-P minerals such as hydroxyapatite as the predominant form of adsorbed P (*e.g.*
300 Johansson and Gustafsson 2000; Drizo et al. 2002).

301 **2.4.3. NUA**

302 Neutralised Used Acid (NUA) is a by-product from the production of synthetic rutile from ilmenite,
303 formed by using sulphuric acid to leach impurities from ilmenite. The spent acidic wastewater is then
304 neutralised with quicklime to form NUA. This reaction results in an intimate mixture of Fe-
305 (oxy)hydroxides and related Fe-minerals (~30-35%), and gypsum (~60%), with minor quartz (~5%)
306 also present, with a high surface area, and a range of surfaces potentially amenable to P-uptake. A
307 long-term (ca. 1500 day) study using NUA as a 5% soil amendment demonstrated a 97% reduction
308 in leachable P. Observations of on-going gypsum dissolution from the NUA has likely resulted in the
309 formation of Ca-P minerals including apatite, whilst fine-grained Fe-(oxy)hydroxides also acted as a
310 substrate for P-adsorption (Douglas et al. 2012).

311 **2.4.4. Coal Fly Ash**

312 Coal Fly Ash (CFA) is produced in large quantities internationally. Recent studies indicated that
313 chitosan-modified CFA can effectively reduce the TP in the water column by flocculating algal cells
314 (Yuan et al., 2015). The Al and Fe contained in CFA facilitated chitosan binding for algal removal
315 due to improved charge neutralization, which may also contribute to P binding and depress P release
316 when settled on the sediment.

317 **3. Guiding principles for the assessment, application and development of P-adsorptive** 318 **materials**

319 In the development and application of materials to freshwater ecosystems to address eutrophication,
320 and in particular to reduce bioavailable P concentrations, a number of common general guiding
321 principles should be employed in order to achieve an optimal outcome. These guiding principles can
322 be readily incorporated into a decision support system and risk assessment framework (*e.g.* Hickey

323 and Gibbs 2009) that is underpinned by characterisation of the system status and function, the mode
324 of application and intended target of the P-adsorptive materials, fiscal constraints, and stakeholder
325 buy-in and acceptance. The guiding principles are outlined below.

326 *3.1. Target setting*

327 In any lake management project it is essential to first set a series of realistic water quality targets
328 against which the success of the implemented measure can be assessed. The drivers of restoration will
329 be site specific and may include water quality targets dictated by policy (e.g. European Water
330 Framework Directive; EC 2000), human health risk thresholds of cyanobacteria biomass (e.g. WHO
331 2008), economic benefits to industry and society (e.g. Pretty et al.2003; Dodds et al.2009), reduction
332 of the need to control taste and odour problems in drinking water treatment plants (Codd 2000), and
333 biodiversity or habitat conservation interests (e.g. JNCC 2005). The likelihood that the use of any P-
334 adsorbent will achieve multiple non-target benefits (i.e. over and above the control of P) should be
335 considered fully prior to application. Similarly, the risk that P-adsorbents may have undesirable
336 effects on management targets (e.g., for external nutrient load targets) and ecotoxicity should also be
337 fully considered. For example, Gunn et al. (2014) report a range of responses in non-native invasive
338 aquatic macrophyte species in Loch Flemington following an improvement in water clarity associated
339 with a lanthanum-modified bentonite (LMB) application, although cause-effect was not quantified. In
340 this case, water quality and human health risk targets were met, at least in the short term, but
341 conservation outcomes were negatively impacted.

342 Lake management is rarely driven by simple targets for P or phytoplankton biomass reduction, but
343 instead by a myriad of interacting, and, at times conflicting processes driven by a diverse stakeholder
344 community. The diversity in the stakeholder community can in itself lead to conflicting demands in
345 relation to desired ecosystem services or goods. Of course, where wide reaching policy is relevant
346 (e.g. across EU WFD lakes), then some level of inter-calibration can support common standard/target
347 setting approaches across large numbers of lakes. For example, in the EU a relatively complex set of
348 metrics has been proposed and calibrated across member states, with which ecological status
349 following degradation and mitigation phases can be quantified (Birk et al. 2013). It is important that

350 any geo-engineering measures be assessed in line with these targets, especially where they are being
351 used for reporting on statutory responsibilities of environmental regulators. In this case, monitoring
352 procedures, metric calculation approaches and targets are standardised (Poikane et al. 2015) although
353 each metric may have uncertainty associated with it (Carvalho et al. 2012).

354 It would be useful to develop material specific targets to ensure high confidence in their practical
355 application. For example, the minimum concentration of the material in bed sediments relative to
356 water column or sediment TP concentrations could be used to determine effective dose (e.g. Huser et
357 al.2015). Reductions in TP flux measured using intact core incubations may also be a useful
358 determinant to employ to indicate effectiveness of the control of internal P loading (Reitzel et
359 al.2015). Similarly, where ecotoxicological issues are possible, minimum concentrations of high-risk
360 components could be set and monitored as part of a licence agreement between water managers and
361 regulatory bodies (e.g. the standard for dissolved lanthanum at $10.1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ in place in the Netherlands;
362 similar targets exist for Al in most countries). It is also important to explore the national scale
363 inventory of lakes failing these targets, to produce estimates of the wider scale need for such
364 management approaches and the potential for negative unintended consequences at the large scale
365 (Spears and Maberly 2014).

366 *3.2. System characterisation and function*

367 A holistic understanding of system function is fundamental to the effective application of any P-
368 adsorptive material in a freshwater ecosystem. This understanding includes knowledge of the size of
369 the inventory of labile nutrients associated with bottom sediments, the magnitude of sediment nutrient
370 fluxes, and changes in nutrient speciation related to, for example, anoxia. A further basic requirement
371 is knowledge of temporal changes in limnological characteristics of the waterbody, including water
372 volume, nutrient concentrations, phytoplankton biomass and composition, temperature and dissolved
373 oxygen through the water column and duration of stratification. These measurements should be part of
374 a water quality monitoring program that has ideally been established prior to any material application.
375 In addition, external nutrient inputs should be quantified (e.g. Welch et al. 2015), so that a nutrient
376 budget can be established to better understand the potential longevity of an application (e.g. Catherine

377 et al. 2010). Additional variables, including macrophyte cover, zooplankton, benthic
378 macroinvertebrates, fish and avian populations, should also ideally be part of the monitoring
379 programme and can provide valuable evidence of either acute (e.g., ecotoxicological) or long-term
380 responses to geoengineering (Wang et al. in press). For example, one of the premises of geo-
381 engineering for eutrophic, phytoplankton-dominated shallow lakes is to bring about a regime shift to
382 macrophyte-dominated vegetation; sampling of both phytoplankton and macrophyte populations
383 would provide documentation of such a change. While the collection and synthesis of the above data
384 constitutes an on-going financial encumbrance, particularly if monitoring is maintained over a number
385 of years, it must be balanced with the intrinsic ecological and social value of the aquatic system, and
386 the requirement to be able to make sufficiently well-informed assessments of the management
387 requirements.

388 Monitoring can also provide information about nutrient limitation of phytoplankton growth, which
389 may be based on measurements of total and dissolved nutrient species, often augmented with
390 laboratory-based trials (e.g. bioassays) to provide more direct indications of nutrient limitation. In an
391 ideal scenario, the collective system knowledge could also be integrated into a biophysical model of
392 the system (e.g. Battin et al., 2008). Importantly, this model can then inform the development of water
393 quality targets for dissolved P and other nutrient species (e.g. Polkane et al. 2014), as well as the
394 timing and dose(s) of one or more P-adsorptive materials. Modelling can also assist with testing
395 different dosing scenarios refine the procedure with the aim of reducing the extant water column P
396 concentration in addition to the internal loading, and decreasing phytoplankton biomass and the
397 occurrence of undesirable species.

398 *3.3. P-adsorptive materials – a multiplicity of roles in freshwater aquatic systems*

399 Performance testing of P-adsorptive materials in terms of reaction kinetics, total uptake capacity,
400 influence of other chemical species, and physicochemical conditions is essential to best estimate
401 dosage and select the most suitable materials for application in eutrophic freshwater systems. We
402 differentiate below three scenarios which can involve performance testing.

403 *Water column (days to weeks):* In the initial phase where the P-adsorptive material is applied to
404 surface waters, the material may be fully dispersed into constituent particles or aggregates to
405 maximise the available surface area, the reactivity and hence the potential for P uptake. The
406 immediate focus here is to reduce the bioavailable P inventory in the water column. Settling of the
407 added material, particularly if there are flocs or aggregates, would normally occur in quiescent
408 laboratory conditions within two days but may be longer (e.g. weeks to months) under natural
409 conditions, particularly in deep waters, under well-mixed conditions or via wind-induced resuspension
410 or convective overturn (Spears et al. 2013b).

411 *Reactive capping (weeks to months):* Once settled, the role of the P-adsorptive material fundamentally
412 changes. If distributed evenly and in sufficient quantity over the bottom sediment, it forms a pervasive
413 barrier of P-adsorptive material to act as a reactive (absorptive) capping agent in intimate contact with
414 the bottom sediments. Hence the role of the P-adsorptive material is to act primarily as a reactive
415 capping to intercept P migrating upward in the sediments, with varying fidelity depending on the
416 thickness, extent of sediment coverage, and P mass in the bottom sediments. The reactivity of the
417 settled P-adsorptive material will likely be less than that when present in the water column due to
418 aggregation, and possibly compaction, limiting ingress into, and interaction with, P-rich porewaters in
419 the bottom sediments. This is likely to be balanced in part, however, by the thickness of the applied
420 P-adsorptive material, (e.g. typically 1-2 mm for lanthanum-modified bentonite), such that there will
421 be substantial physicochemical interaction between any P migrating upwards from the bottom
422 sediments and the reactive capping layer. The longevity of the reactive capping of P-adsorptive
423 material will be a function of any remaining P-uptake capacity at the time of sedimentation to the
424 bottom, the bottom-sediment P flux and physical transport of the material due to resuspension or
425 bottom currents. Of primary importance, however, is how quickly the material is buried vertically
426 (Meis et al. 2011; Reitzel et al. 2015) or translocated horizontally (Yasseri et al., 2015) as a result of
427 deposition of material from the overlying water column (related to catchment P loads) and physically
428 and biologically induced bed disturbance and sediment focussing, which are discussed below.

429 *Buried or redistributed reactive capping (months to years):* In the majority of freshwater systems two
430 processes induce the burial of any applied P-adsorptive material. The first is bioturbation, particularly
431 where fish or benthic fauna create deep conduits within the bottom sediment and migrating P bypasses
432 the reactive capping (e.g. Nogaro et al. 2006; Huser et al. 2015). In general, disturbance of the
433 capping layer by benthic fauna will redistribute the P-adsorptive material and lead to heterogeneous
434 coverage that potentially may reduce its effectiveness. The dosage should be based on this interacting
435 sediment depth to avoid dilution of the P-adsorptive material in relation to the potential P pool.

436 The second key process is the addition of new particulate material to the bottom sediments.
437 Deposition rates increase in the presence of storm events but these events may also elevate nutrient
438 concentrations and increase rates of deposition of organic material to the bottom sediments. This
439 process alone may be sufficient to bury any applied P-adsorptive materials, although production of
440 autochthonous organic matter (e.g. phytoplankton) will be reduced in the treated water column. In
441 addition, focussing (preferential deposition) of new sediment or the applied P-adsorptive material may
442 compromise the integrity of the reactive capping layer and physically mix and dilute the capping
443 layer. Although some redistribution and progressive burial of the P-adsorptive material is to be
444 expected, materials that are insensitive to changes in redox status and form highly insoluble
445 compounds may, depending on whether they retain any remaining P-uptake capacity, still function
446 effectively as a P-sink whilst buried within the bottom sediments.

447 *3.4. Composition, mineralogy and physical morphology of potential nutrient adsorptive materials*

448 The composition and mineralogy of a potential nutrient adsorptive material are major determinants of
449 its function, effectiveness and potential viability and efficacy. The goal is to be able to precisely
450 match the attributes of the P-adsorptive material to the nature of the system to ensure effective P
451 reduction. Relevant attributes include the composition, particle size and density of the material, as
452 well as its performance under pH and redox conditions that approximate but also extend beyond those
453 expected in the system. Relevant attributes in the context of different materials are given in Table 1.

454 On the basis of composition and mineralogy, many prospective materials, including some natural soils
455 or industrial by-products derived from the mining, mineral processing or other industries, although

456 potentially possessing one or more promising characteristics, may be deemed inappropriate.
457 Examples might include materials containing fibres, leachable/labile trace elements including metals
458 and metalloids, or in specific cases, naturally occurring radionuclides. Nonetheless, if assessed and
459 considered on a case by case basis, many natural materials such as shales, serpentinite, soils and
460 sands, and mining or mineral processing by-products such as red mud and slags, may also be
461 considered for specific applications (Table 1). Materials manufactured from well-defined precursor
462 materials, however, such as allophane and imogolite, and modified clay and zeolite have a distinct
463 advantage of tighter quality control and composition, with less natural variation. In addition, the
464 active constituent is not diluted by other inert or inactive components such as may be the case in
465 mining or mineral processing by-products, and hence tends to have a higher and more consistent P-
466 uptake capacity.

467 Of fundamental importance when considering the development of a P-adsorptive material is its
468 sensitivity to changes in redox status (e.g. Douglas et al. 2004). Many eutrophic aquatic systems are
469 characterised by large external loads of labile organic carbon and/or high rates of generation of
470 organic carbon within the system. Microbially-mediated degradation of this material will facilitate
471 often spatially extensive and sustained periods of water column anoxia and low redox state. Thus, the
472 majority of Fe-based materials, while possessing some potential as soil amendments within
473 catchments or as reactive media in constructed wetlands, are unlikely to be suitable for deployment in
474 eutrophic aquatic systems. These materials are highly redox sensitive and are likely to release
475 previously accumulated P during reductive dissolution. Under circumstances when anoxia occurs,
476 even if only briefly, the appropriate P adsorbents will include hydrotalcites, allophane/imogolite, rare
477 earth modified clays, carbonates/calcined derivatives or soils and soil derivatives (depending on
478 composition), all of which are insensitive to redox status (Table 1).

479 The sensitivity of P-adsorbent materials to other physicochemical conditions in the water column,
480 besides redox status, also requires *a priori* evaluation, for example using laboratory- or mesocosm-
481 scale assessments. The most important of these physicochemical conditions is pH. Changes in pH
482 may affect both uptake capacity and kinetics of P-adsorbent materials, and in the worst case can

483 potentially lead to massive releases of accumulated P due to dissolution or ion-exchange reactions.
484 Ideally the P-adsorbent material will have a wide operational pH range that spans both moderately
485 acidic conditions of pH 5-6 up to pH of at least 10, corresponding to values attained during major
486 phytoplankton blooms in poorly buffered systems. In this respect, La-based materials are often ideal
487 given the wide pH stability of lanthanum phosphate minerals (Table 1 and Copetti et al., 2015),
488 although some lanthanum may potentially be released to the water column above pH 9 (Reitzel et al.,
489 2013). Alternatively some materials such as carbonates (circumneutral pH) and calcined derivatives
490 (high pH) may possess a degree of buffering capacity, albeit at substantially differing pH. In the
491 specific case of carbonates this may be undesirable for application in a freshwater aquatic system
492 where the final pH may increase to above 9.5.

493 System-specific factors such as the composition of the water in terms of both major and trace
494 elements, dissolved organic carbon and alkalinity, may also affect uptake kinetics and in some cases
495 have a major impact on total P uptake capacity. This may occur, for example, due to the precipitation
496 of unintended secondary phases in place of the target nutrient such as lanthanum carbonates instead of
497 lanthanum phosphates associated with DOC complexation at exchange sites(e.g. Lurling, et al. 2014;
498 Spears et al. 2015).

499 In addition to considerations of the composition, mineralogy, physicochemical behaviour and water-
500 P-adsorbent interactions outlined above, the morphology, and in particular particle size distribution
501 and density, are also key considerations in the development of P-adsorptive materials. In the context
502 of aquatic system applications this may in some cases be advantageous as materials can be rapidly
503 conveyed to the bottom sediments by virtue of their large particle size and/or high density, and may
504 also be more resistant to resuspension and transport. Conversely, however, these characteristics may
505 also increase the rate of burial via displacement of less dense particles or aggregates extant in the
506 bottom sediment. Generally, the reactivity of P-adsorptive materials will decrease with the ratio of
507 particle surface area to volume.

508 *3.5. Ecotoxicity*

509 The ecotoxicological profile of a P-adsorptive material is of paramount importance and is often
510 closely aligned with its mineralogy, physical form, chemical composition and origin (e.g. slags and
511 fly ash, Table 1). A suite of detailed ecotoxicological tests should be undertaken in order to assess the
512 extent of possible acute and chronic ecotoxicological impacts on a range of biota relevant to the
513 aquatic system to be treated (e.g. Stauber 2000; Stauber and Binet 2000; Lurling and Tolman 2010;
514 Reitzel et al.2012; Spears et al. 2013a; Van Oosterhout and Lurling 2011, 2013; Wang et al. 2015).
515 For estuary applications the ecotoxicological testing may also need to encompass both fresh and
516 saline waters. Tests on biota should also include considerations due to physical changes in sediment
517 composition; from burial to changes in sediment particle size and impacts on sediment irrigation
518 processes.

519 *3.6. Evaluation of P-adsorbent materials prior to full-scale implementation*

520 Given the inherent diversity of freshwater systems in terms of both bottom-sediment composition and
521 water quality, and the diversity of potential P-adsorbents available (Table 1), a fundamental
522 prerequisite to full-scale application of P-adsorbent material is a suitably scaled assessment of P-
523 uptake performance, which may also help to foreshadow any unforeseen or unintended treatment
524 consequences. Once the most appropriate P-adsorbent material(s) has been chosen, a suite of
525 potential evaluation steps may be employed. These may range, in increasing order of scale,
526 complexity, time and cost, from laboratory testing of water samples alone to core samples
527 incorporating both bottom sediment and water, both stirred and unstirred to simulate sediment–water
528 exchange, to small (metre-scale) and/or larger (many metres or isolated portions of an aquatic system)
529 mesocosm studies incorporating many of the major elements (water, sediment, biota, atmospheric
530 exchange, mixing, stratification) of the aquatic system (e.g. Douglas et al. 2008; Pan et al., 2011).

531 Importantly, with increasing scale comes an increased understanding of the performance of, and
532 confidence in, the P-adsorbent material in the system of interest. In addition, other fundamentally
533 important variables such as dose, performance in terms of kinetics, total uptake capacity and potential
534 longevity, are able to be better simulated, but ability to achieve replication or carry out multiple
535 treatments is usually not possible. Ideally, mesocosm-scale trials, where appropriately replicated, and

536 with suitable controls, can provide a convenient *in-situ* ‘laboratory’ to evaluate aspects of changes, if
537 any, in benthic biota due to physical (*e.g.* smothering of benthic biota), chemical (interaction of the
538 adsorbent with the water column) or ecotoxicological (*e.g.* from chemical interaction or direct
539 ingestion) effects from the application of the P-adsorbent material (Douglas et al. 2004). For instance,
540 an enclosure experiment testing lanthanum-modified bentonite (LMB), dredging and their
541 combination (Lürling and Faassen 2012) also revealed gradually increased filterable La
542 concentrations in the LMB treated enclosures, to concentrations of above 100 µg La L⁻¹, that made the
543 authorities conclude LMB was not an option as these concentrations exceeded the Dutch La standard.

544 3.7. Cost-benefit analysis

545 The cost of eutrophication and the cumulative effects of phytoplankton blooms and changes in
546 ecosystem function can be considered on five levels:

- 547 • the loss of ecosystem function and values with eutrophication;
- 548 • a status quo, “do nothing”, approach;
- 549 • the implementation of one or more technologies to reduce nutrient loads and concentrations;
- 550 • the implementation of existing P-adsorbent technologies (Table 1);and
- 551 • the development of novel interventions or management technologies.

552 Estimates of the costs of eutrophication and phytoplankton blooms have been made in a number of
553 studies. Recently, Hamilton et al. (2014) estimated costs in a range of categories including
554 surveillance and monitoring, treating and managing surface water supplies and management of
555 nutrient catchment loads, with the conclusion that factors such as increasing nutrient export and
556 climate change are likely to lead to increases in management costs in the future. Hamilton et al.
557 (2014) provide a range of costs for cyanobacteria blooms in different freshwater systems across the
558 world, including a single bloom event in Lake Taihu (China) of costs c.US\$20M. Dodds et al. (2009)
559 estimated the costs of eutrophication management in the USA to be approximately US \$2.2B
560 annually. In Australia the costs of freshwater cyanobacterial bloom management have been estimated
561 to be between AU\$180M and 220M annually (LWRRDC 1998). In England and Wales the cost was

562 estimated to be between US\$105M and 160M annually (Pretty et al. 2003) comprised of reduced
563 values to waterfront dwellings, additional drinking water treatment costs, reduced amenity of
564 waterbodies, removal of algal toxins and decomposition products from drinking waters, the reduced
565 value of non-polluted atmosphere (e.g. geosmin), ecological effects and tourist industry losses.

566 Contemporary management of eutrophication symptoms in freshwater and estuarine systems
567 emphasises source reduction from both diffuse and agricultural point sources through implementation
568 of best practice. In Australia, at least, changing agricultural practices and effecting behavioural
569 changes take considerable time and are reliant on the development of new approaches. Although
570 substantial effort is now being directed to fertiliser management and point source reduction, it will be
571 many years before effective reductions in nutrient losses to waterways will be achieved. In the
572 interim there is substantial pressure and public expectation to reduce algal blooms and fish kills. In
573 some cases there is no “Do Nothing” option as major highly developed estuaries are on the edge of
574 ecological collapse. Phosphorus adsorptive clays or materials allow P accumulated in sediments to be
575 treated and offer rapid topical treatment options for water bodies to address legacies of P within these
576 systems.

577 Placed in the context of whole catchment solutions, the cost of P adsorptive clay treatments is
578 relatively low, depending of course on the efficacy and cost of the material. In Western Australia
579 (WA) application of LMB in small cyanobacteria-prone water bodies showed an immediate reduction
580 of 95% to 99% in P available for algal growth for the expenditure of about \$150,000 per application.
581 Similar reductions from primary nutrient sources would have taken years of behaviour change and a
582 substantially higher cost. Whole-of-catchment solutions that cost many millions of dollars over a long
583 time period are still required and P adsorptive materials offer promise when used as part of “treatment
584 train” approach. As a comparison, if P adsorptive materials were used as the sole treatment in
585 selected agricultural drains in WA the cost of \$1M per year compares to estimates of \$100M over ten
586 years to reduce nutrients at source. These estimates should not be taken to mean that the authors do
587 not advocate for sustainable long-term solutions involving catchment restoration. Rather, they indicate

588 that a balance of investment is required between catchment restoration and use of P adsorptive
589 materials where there is a prerogative to address eutrophication in a timely, cost-effective manner.

590 Based on the authors' experiences, we consider below the level of investment required in research and
591 development, from concept to application of novel P-adsorptive materials. We include considerations
592 of patenting and commercialisation. To this end, an estimate of the costs that may be typically
593 involved in product development is given after each component in parentheses below. These estimates
594 constitute what may be considered typical costs but may vary substantially on a case by case basis.

595 Conservatively, it may take two years for a material to be conceived and tested at a laboratory scale
596 prior to more extensive in-field assessment. For this we have assumed a nominal salary of USD\$100K
597 for the researcher for each of the two years (USD\$200K). Ecotoxicological evaluation may include
598 acute and chronic effects testing over at least four trophic levels commensurate with the likely
599 population of target aquatic ecosystems (USD\$200K). Field trials are typically 1-2 seasons in
600 duration, involving both research and technical staff, construction, sampling and analysis costs
601 (\$200K). Regulatory approvals may typically take a year in each separate jurisdiction or country,
602 however, requirements are often similar for each although local consultants may be required to
603 manage each on a case-by-case basis (\$100K). If the nutrient adsorptive material is deemed
604 sufficiently novel then patenting for both national (country of origin) and international jurisdictions of
605 relevance may be undertaken (USD\$250K). If it is deemed that the technology has potential
606 commercial value, project management, usually by the inventor but with legal and business
607 assistance, identification of a partner company and full technology transfer including initiation and
608 monitoring of field trials, stakeholder and regulatory liaison and reporting, may occur for at least two
609 years (USD\$250K). Thus, there may be considerable delays in the testing of an initial concept,
610 through extensive laboratory and field trials over a variety of scales, upscaling of manufacture,
611 ecotoxicological testing, regulatory submission and approval (with the possible imposition of
612 conditions), and engagement of commercial partners. Many of these steps may also have to be
613 repeated in each new jurisdiction, placing a considerable cost and intellectual burden on the developer

614 or applicant, notwithstanding many years of trials and validation, before there is widespread
615 regulatory and public acceptance, as well as commercial return on investment.

616 Thus, based on some conservative estimates outlined above, the development of a novel, viable,
617 nutrient adsorptive material may cost in the order of USD\$1.2M. In addition to the above, however,
618 given the traditionally conservative nature of many management agencies and stakeholders of aquatic
619 systems, some years may elapse between recognition and ownership of the (eutrophication) problem.
620 After this recognition follows the need for active intervention, the demonstration of successful trials,
621 regulatory and stakeholder acceptance, and the ability to quarantine and direct the requisite funding,
622 perhaps over a number of years, also involving the concomitant management of external loads, to
623 enable full-scale intervention.

624 *3.8. Regulatory approval*

625 In the majority of jurisdictions, regulatory approval is required to implement P-adsorptive materials
626 directly to lakes. While regulatory requirements may vary considerably between jurisdictions, and for
627 different P-adsorbents (Table 1), a demonstrable thread of characterisation including mineralogical
628 and chemical testing, ecotoxicity assessment and extensive laboratory trials are generally required to
629 determine both efficacy and safety. The Netherlands is the only country in the world that has an
630 official La standard of $10.1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ as the maximum allowable concentration (MAC) in fresh surface
631 water (Sneller et al. 2000). Hence, the residual filterable La concentration following application of
632 LMB is of great importance. The MAC is based on studies performed by NOTOX B.V. in 1995
633 (NOTOX 1995). The reported No Observed Effect Concentration (NOEC) of $100 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ has been
634 divided by 10 giving the maximum allowable addition of $10.1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, which with an estimated
635 background concentration of $0.1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$, yields the MAC of $10.1 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ (Sneller et al. 2000). The
636 underlying chronic *Daphnia magna* reproduction test contained a period of several days in which the
637 test animals received less food and in the treatments showed lower reproduction, but reproduction was
638 restored to normal (similar to controls) when food supply was increased again. Since cumulative
639 reproduction was chosen as the endpoint, this unusual experimental condition led to the NOEC of 100
640 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$. In the period of less food in the highest La doses, precipitation and consequently food

641 limitation may have occurred (Lürling and Tolman 2010). In addition, calculating exposure
642 concentrations based on the geometric mean of the two extremes in the measured La concentrations
643 (NOTOX 1995) gave a value half or less than if all data had been used in determining a mean or
644 median. Hence, there are significant doubts regarding the validity of the official Dutch La standard.
645 Nonetheless, filterable La has to be measured and values exceeding the Dutch La standard, even when
646 these are caused by insoluble and non-bioavailable La-oxyanion colloids, can lead to a ‘no-
647 go’ situation as was evidenced in Pond De Ploeg in 2009 (Lürling et al. 2012). The combined
648 application of LMB and a low dose flocculent (poly-aluminium chloride, PAC) needed a thorough
649 risk assessment prior to application in Lake Rauwbraken (The Netherlands, 2008; Lürling and van
650 Oosterhout 2013). However, a follow-up whole-lake experiment in Lake De Kuil (The Netherlands,
651 2009; Waajen et al. 2015) situated in the jurisdiction of a neighbouring water authority to Lake
652 Rauwbraken met strong opposition from the legislator for Al treatment. Despite scientific
653 documentation and safety reporting, the legislator refused to licence a permit for PAC; instead
654 Fe(III)chloride had to be used as a flocculent. This example illustrates that regulatory approval may
655 differ even within a country depending on the interpretation of the legislator involved. It is evident
656 that only well-documented case studies can address such situations and thus applications should
657 include thorough long-term post application monitoring to validate treatment performance and
658 provide robust data that can be used to assist in determining safety and efficacy of whole of lake
659 experiments or prescribed treatments (e.g. Özkundakci et al. 2010).

660 *3.9. Public/social acceptance*

661 In the majority of freshwater ecosystems it is a fundamental requirement as a prelude to intervention
662 that robust, independent scientific assessment is obtained to underpin all interactions with
663 stakeholders in terms of both regulatory approval (as discussed above) and the general public (e.g.
664 Spears et al. 2013). Critically important in this process is to make available the scientific assessment
665 in a transparent, palatable, and user-friendly fashion. This is particularly so where P-adsorbents may
666 be nominally considered as industrial waste materials (e.g. slags or fly ash, Table 1) or are considered
667 novel or not naturally-occurring (e.g. La-substituted materials, Table 1). Ideally, the preliminary

668 dissemination of information will commence in parallel with the initial assessment or laboratory/pilot
669 trial stages such that elements of misinformation or scepticism are addressed in the first instance.
670 Ideally, the stakeholders will be engaged early and kept fully informed of the progress to facilitate a
671 partnership, garner acceptance and intellectual buy-in before, during and after full-scale
672 implementation of the nutrient management process.

673 A method to address the multiple issues raised above would be to establish a multinational Centre of
674 Excellence in P-adsorbent technology (Spears et al. 2013). The Centre would seek to bring a unified
675 approach and consensus to some of the critical steps, including public acceptance, regulatory
676 approvals, ecotoxicological tests and limit-setting, time periods from concept to full-scale application,
677 and provision of commercial quantities of the P-adsorbent. The Centre could leverage resources and
678 facilitate further research, development and validation of the performance of P-adsorbents in addition
679 to aligning approval processes for use, thus streamlining a process currently fraught with myriad
680 regulatory and other roadblocks both within and between countries.

681 **4. Conclusions**

682 The goal of effective interception, containment and long-term immobilization of phosphorus from
683 point and/or diffuse sources has gained increasing prominence over the past two decades. This is
684 particularly so as more efficient and environmentally acceptable methods are sought to combat the
685 effects of eutrophication in freshwater ecosystems.

686 The application of P-adsorptive materials to freshwater aquatic systems to manage the effects of
687 eutrophication constitutes a nexus spanning a range of considerations. These include meeting water
688 quality goals, including public health requirements, public perception and acceptance, and (partial)
689 restoration of ecosystem function, intended use (water column or reactive sediment barrier),
690 operational performance, and hence longevity of the efficacy of the P-adsorptive material.

691 It is evident that P is generally the nutrient that can be made limiting to such an extent that
692 eutrophication and some of its associated symptoms of harmful algal blooms and bottom-water
693 anoxia, can be minimised (e.g., Lürling and van Oosterhout 2013). Such intervention to reduce N to

694 concentrations similarly limiting to phytoplankton grow is often not possible. Hence, the development
695 of materials for the control of in-system P has been the focus of recent efforts in this field. These
696 developments have led to a better understanding of the operational performance of a wide range of P-
697 adsorptive materials as well as practical and socio-economic factors associated with their widespread
698 use in freshwater ecosystem management. To consolidate this evidence and expedite its practical
699 uptake we call for a multi-national collaboration and research centre to develop and test P adsorptive
700 materials, boost scientific insights, and reduce the delay from concept to market.

701 **5. Acknowledgements**

702 The authors gratefully acknowledge the support of the CSIRO and Strategic Priority Research
703 Program of Chinese Academy of Sciences (XDA09030203).

Table 1. Summary of common phosphorus adsorbents used in aquatic systems and their properties Modified after Douglas et al., (2004).

Material	Selected references	Composition	P-uptake	Cost	Advantages	Disadvantages
Naturally-occurring minerals or earth materials						
Carbonates	Shilton et al. (2005); ;Karaca et al. (2006); Mateus et al. (2012) ; Jaouadi et al. (2013); Xu et al. (2014)	Ca, Mg, carbonates	Low to moderate depends on source, particle size and composition	Low	Abundant, naturally occurring	May depend on limestone type
Soils, sands, suspended particles	Arias et al. (2000); Degens et al. (2000); Kim et al. (2014); Dai and Pan (2014); Pan et al., (2002, 2013)	Na-K-Ca-Mg aluminosilicates, Fe-oxides; Fe-(oxy)hydroxides	Low to moderate depending on composition, mineralogy, particle size	Low	Naturally occurring	May depend on soil type, siltation
Natural or synthetically-produced materials						
Allophane and imogolite	Wada, (1989); Farmer and Russell (1990);	Aluminosilicate	High uptake capacity	Mod-high	May occur in some soils	Industrial-scale synthesis
Fe-Al (oxy)hydroxides	Barrow (1999); Lu et al. (2014);	Fe-(oxy)hydroxides	Low - high depends on mineralogy/particle size	Low	May also occur in soils	Reductive dissolution (Fe), P-release
Hydrotalcite	Miyata, (1980, 1983); Shin et al. (1996); Yang et al. (2014)	Mg-Al hydroxide	High uptake capacity	Mod-high	Simple synthesis	Industrial-scale synthesis
Modified clay minerals or soils						
Expanded/thermally treated clay aggregates	Zhu et al. (1997), Johannsen et al. (1995); Adam et al. (2007) ; Gan et al., (2009), Yin et al., (2013)	Aluminosilicates calcined to form porous aggregates	Low to moderate	Low-Mod	Clay mineral	Industrial scale process
La-modified bentonite, vermiculite, zeolite or soils	Robb et al. (2003); Douglas et al. (2008) ; Huang et al. (2014); Yuan et al., (2009); Ning et al., (2008); Xie et al., (2014)	Na or K aluminosilicates modified with La	Moderate, depends on clay/soil cation exchange	Mod	Clay, simple synthesis	Suitable La, industrial process
Mining, mineral processing and industrial by-products						
Red mud/sand	Thornber and Hughes (1987);	Fe/Al (oxy)hydroxide, \pm gypsum	Low to moderate, depends on composition		Abundant in certain regions, low cost	Often high pH, trace elements, potential ecotoxicity
Slags	Drizo et al (2006); Douglas et al. (2012); Wendling et al. (2012, 2013); Barka et al. (2014)	Alkali/alkaline earth aluminosilicates	Low to moderate, depends on composition		Abundant, low cost	Often high pH, trace elements, potential ecotoxicity
NUA	Douglas et al. (2012)	Fe-(oxy)hydroxides, gypsum	High to very high	Low	Low cost, high P uptake	High Ca, SO ₄ from gypsum dissolution

1 References

- 2 Abell JM, Hamilton DP (2015) Biogeochemical processes and phytoplankton nutrient limitation in the
3 inflow transition zone of a large eutrophic lake during a summer rain event. *Ecohydrol* 8:243–262
- 4 Adam K, Sovik AK, Krogstad T, Heistad A (2007) Phosphorus removal by the filter materials light-
5 weight aggregates and shell sand – a review of processes and experimental set-ups for improved
6 design of filter systems for wastewater treatment. *Vatten* 63:245-257
- 7 Anderson DL, Tuovinen OH, Faber A, Ostrokowski I (1995) Use of soil amendments to reduce
8 soluble phosphorus in dairy soils. *Ecol Eng* 5:229-246
- 9 Arias CA, Del Bubba M, Brix H (2000) Phosphorus removal by sands for use as a media in
10 subsurface flow constructed reed beds. *Water Res* 35:1159-1168
- 11 Babin J, Prepas EF, Murphy TP, Hamilton HR (1989) A test of the effects of lime on algal biomass
12 and total phosphorus concentrations in Edmonton storm water retention lakes. *Lake Reserv*
13 *Manage* 5:129-135
- 14 Baken S, Verbeeck M, Verheyen D, Diels J, Smolders E (2015) Phosphorus losses from agricultural
15 land to natural waters are reduced by immobilisation in iron-rich sediments in drainage ditches.
16 *Water Res* 71:160-170
- 17 Baker MJ, Blowes DW, Ptacek CJ (1998) Laboratory development of permeable reactive mixtures for
18 the removal of phosphorus from onsite wastewater disposal systems. *Environ Sci Technol*
19 32:2308-2316
- 20 Barca, C, Meyer, D Liira, M, Drissen, P, Comeau, Y, Andres, Y Chazarenc, F (2014) Steel slag filters
21 upgrade phosphorus removal in small wastewater treatment plants: removal mechanisms and
22 performance. *Ecol Eng* 68:214-222
- 23 Barreal ME, Camps Arbestian, M, Macais F, Fertitta AE (2001) Phosphate and sulphate retention by
24 non volcanic soils with acidic properties. *Soil Sci* 166:691-707
- 25 Barrow, NJ (1970) Comparison of the adsorption of molybdate, sulphate and phosphate by soils. *Soil*
26 *Sci* 109:282-288
- 27 Barrow, NJ (1982) Possibility of using caustic residue from bauxite for improving the chemical and
28 physical properties of sandy soils. *Aust J Agric Res* 33:275-285
- 29 Barrow, NJ (1999) The four laws of soil chemistry: the Leeper lecture 1998. *Aust J Soil Res* 37:787-
30 829
- 31 Battin E, Kaplan LA, Findlay S, Hopkinson CS, Marti E, Packman AI, Newbold D, Sabater, F (2008)
32 Biophysical controls on organic carbon fluxes in fluvial networks. *Nature* 454:95-100
- 33 Bergstrom AK, Karlsson D, Karlsson J, and Vrede T (2015) N-limited consumer growth and low
34 nutrient regeneration N:P ratios in lakes with low N deposition. *Ecosphere* 61:9
- 35 Birk S, Willby N, Kell, MG, Bonne W, Borja A, Poikane S, van de Bund W (2013) Intercalibrating
36 classifications of ecological status: Europe's quest for common management. *Sci Total Environ*
37 454–455:490–499
- 38 Bjork S (1988) Redevelopment of Lake Ecosystems - A Case-Study Approach. *Ambio* 17:90-98
- 39 Bolan NS, Syers JK, Tillman RW (1986) Ionic strength effects on the surface charge and adsorption
40 of phosphate and sulfate by soils. *J Soil Sci* 37:379-388
- 41 Booker NA, Priestly AJ, Fraser IH (1999) Struvite formation in wastewater treatment plants:
42 opportunities for nutrient recovery. *Env Tech* 20:777-782.
- 43 Borggaard OK (1983) Effect of surface areas and mineralogy of iron oxides on their surface charge
44 and anion-adsorption properties. *Clay Clay Min* 31:230-232

-
- 45 Borggaard OK, Jorgensen SS, Moberg JP, Raben-Lange B (1990) Influence of organic matter on
46 phosphate adsorption by aluminium and iron oxides in sandy soils. *J Soil Sci* 41:443-449
- 47 Bray RH, Kurtz LT (1945) Determination of total, organic and available forms of phosphorus in soils.
48 *Soil Sci* 59:39-45
- 49 Browman MG, Harris RF, Armstrong DE, Chesters G (1977) Interaction of soluble phosphate with
50 aluminium hydroxide in lakes. *Wat Res Center, Univ Wisconsin, Report WIS WRC 77-05.79 pp*
- 51 Burger DF, Hamilton DP, Hall JA, Ryan E.F (2007) Phytoplankton nutrient limitation in a polymictic
52 eutrophic lake: Community versus species specific responses. *Fundam Appl Limnol* 169:57-68
- 53 Catherine A, Mouillot D, Escoffier N, Bernard C, Trousselier M (2010) Cost effective prediction of
54 the eutrophication status of lakes and reservoirs *Freshw Biol* 55:2425-2435
- 55 Carpenter SR (2008) Phosphorus control is critical to mitigating eutrophication. *Proceed Nat Acad Sci*
56 *USA* 105:11039-11040
- 57 Carvalho L, Poikane S, LycheSolheim A, Phillips G, Borics G, Catalan J, De Hoyos C, Drakare S,
58 Dudley B, Jarvinen M, Laplace-Treyture C, Maileht K, McDonald C, Mischke U, Moe J, Morabito
59 G Nöges P, Nöges T, Ott I, Pasztaleniec, A, Skjelbred B, Thackeray S (2012) Strength and
60 uncertainty of lake phytoplankton metrics for assessing eutrophication impacts in lakes. *Hydrobiol*
61 704:127-140
- 62 Cavani F, Trifiro F, Vaccari A (1991) Hydrotalcite-type anionic clays: preparation, properties and
63 applications. *Catalysis Today* 11:173-301
- 64 Chung Y-C Li, Y-H, Chen, C-C (2005) Pollutant removal from aquaculture wastewater using the
65 biopolymer chitosan at different molecular weights. *J Env Sci Health Part A: Toxic/Haz Subst and*
66 *Env Eng* 40:1775-1790
- 67 Codd G (2000) Cyanobacterial toxins, the perception of water quality, and the prioritisation of
68 eutrophication control. *Ecol Eng* 16:51-60
- 69 Cooke GD., Welch EB (1993). Phosphorus Inactivation and Sediment Oxidation. In: Cooke GD,
70 Welch EB, Peterson SA, Newroth PR (Eds.) *Restoration and Management of Lakes and*
71 *Reservoirs*. Lewis, 161-209
- 72 Conley DJ, Paerl HW, Howarth RW, Boesch DF, Seitzinger SP, Havens KE, Lancelot C, Likens, G.E
73 (2009) Controlling eutrophication: nitrogen and phosphorus. *Science* 323:1014–1015
- 74 Cooke GD, Welch EB, Peterson S, Nichols SA (2005) *Restoration and management of lakes and*
75 *reservoirs*, CRC Press, Boca Raton
- 76 Dai J, Yang H, Yan H, Shanguan Y, Zheng Q, Cheng R (2011) Phosphate adsorption from aqueous
77 solutions by disused adsorbents: chitosan hydrogel beads after the removal of copper (II). *Chem*
78 *Eng J* 166:970-977
- 79 Dai LC, Pan G (2014) The effects of red soil in removing phosphorus from water column and
80 reducing phosphorus release from sediment in Lake Taihu, *Wat Sci Technol* 5:1052-1058
- 81 Degens BP, Schipper LA, Claydon JJ, Russell JM, Yeates GW (2000) Irrigation of allophanic soil
82 with dairy effluent for 22 years: responses of nutrient storage and soil biota. *Aust J Soil Res* 38:25-
83 35
- 84 Denaix L, Lamy I, Bottero JY (1999) Structure and affinity towards Cd^{2+} , Cu^{2+} , Pb^{2+} of synthetic
85 colloidal amorphous aluminosilicates and their precursors. *Coll Surf A*, 158:315-325
- 86 Dithmer L, Gro Nielsen U, Lüring M, Spears BM, Yasseri S, Lundberg D, Moore A, Jensen ND,
87 Reitzel K (in press) Responses in sediment phosphorus and lanthanum concentrations and
88 composition across 10 lakes following applications of lanthanum modified bentonite. *Wat Res*
89 *xx:xxx-xxx*

-
- 90 Dodds WK, Smith VH, Lohman K (2002) Nitrogen and phosphorus relationships to benthic algal
91 biomass in temperate streams. *Can J Fish Aquat Sci* 59:865-874
- 92 Dodds WK, Bouska WW, Eitzmann JL, Pilger TJ, Pitts KL, Riley AJ, Schloesser JT, Thornbrugh, DJ
93 (2009) Eutrophication of US freshwaters: analysis of potential economic damages. *Env Sci*
94 *Technol* 43:12-19
- 95 Douglas GB (1997) Remediation material and remediation process for sediments.
96 PCT/AU(1997/000892
- 97 Douglas GB (2002) Remediation material and remediation process for sediments. US Patent 6350383
- 98 Douglas GB (2014) Contaminant removal from Baal Gammon acidic mine pit water via in situ
99 hydrotalcite formation. *Appl Geochem* 51:15-22
- 100 Douglas GB, Adeney JA, Zappia, LR (2000) Sediment Remediation Project: (1998/9 Laboratory Trial
101 Report. CSIRO Land and Water. Report No. 6/00 (2000): CSIRO
- 102 Douglas GB, Robb MS, Coad DN, Ford PW (2004) A review of solid phase adsorbents for the
103 removal of phosphorus from natural and waste waters. In Valsami-Jones, E Ed. *Phosphorus in*
104 *Environmental Technology – Removal, Recovery, Applications*, IWA Publishing. Chap 13 291-
105 320
- 106 Douglas GB, Robb MS, Ford, PW (2008) Reassessment of the performance of mineral-based
107 sediment capping materials to bind phosphorus: a comment on Akhurst et al. (2004) *Mar Freshw*
108 *Res* 59:836-837
- 109 Douglas GB, Adeney J, Johnston K, Wendling LA, Coleman S (2012) Investigation of major, trace
110 element, nutrient and radionuclide mobility in a mining by-product NUA-amended soil. *J Env*
111 *Qual* 41:1818-1834
- 112 Douglas GB, Wendling LA, Coleman S (2012) Productive use of steelmaking by-product in
113 environmental applications I: Mineralogy and major and trace element geochemistry. *Min Eng*
114 35:49-56
- 115 Douglas GB, Lüring M, Spears, BM (2015) Assessment of changes in potential nutrient limitation in
116 an impounded river after application of lanthanum-modified bentonite. *Wat Res* xx(x), xxx-xxx.
- 117 Downing JA, McCauley E (1992) The nitrogen: phosphorus relationship in lakes. *Limnol Oceanog*
118 37:936-945
- 119 Drizo A, Frost CA, Grace J, Smith, KA. (1999) Physico-chemical screening of phosphate-removing
120 substrates for use in constructed wetland systems. *Wat Res* 33:3595-3602.
- 121 Drizo A, Forget C, Chapuis RP, Comeau Y (2006) Phosphorus removal by electric arc steel furnace
122 slag and serpentinite. *Wat Res* 40:1547-1554
- 123 Egemose S, Reitzel K, Andersen F, Ø Flindt MR., (2010) Chemical lake restoration products: sediment
124 stability and phosphorus dynamics. *Env Sci Technol* 44:985–91
- 125 European Commission (2000) Directive (2000/60/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council
126 of 23rd October (2000) Establishing a Framework for Community Action in the Field of Water
127 Policy. Official Journal of the European Communities, L327/1. European Commission, Brussels
- 128 Firsching FH, Brune SN (1991) Solubility products of trivalent rare-earth phosphates. *J Chem Eng*
129 *Data* 36:93-95
- 130 Francis G (1878) Poisonous Australian Lake. *Nature* 18:11-12
- 131 Gan F, Zhou J, Wang H, Du C, Chen X (2009) Removal of phosphate from aqueous solution by
132 thermally treated natural palygorskite. *Wat Res* 43:2907-2915
- 133 Gibbs MM, Hickey CW, Ozkundacki D (2011) Sustainability assessment and comparison of
134 efficacy of four P-inactivation agents for managing internal phosphorus loads in lakes:
135 sediment incubations. *Hydrobiol* 658:253-275

-
- 136 Goundar MS, Morrison RJ, Togomana C (20??) Phosphorus requirements of some selected soil types
137 in the Fiji sugarcane belt. *South Pac J Nat Appl Sci* 3:1-10
- 138 Gröger M (2010) Das Gesetz vom Minimum. *Chem. Unserer Zeit*, 44:340 – 343
- 139 Gunn, I.D.M Meis S Maberly, S.C Spears B.M (2014) Assessing the responses of aquatic
140 macrophytes to the application of a lanthanum modified bentonite clay, at Loch Flemington,
141 Scotland, UK. *Hydrobiol* 737:309-320
- 142 Hamilton DP, Wood, SA, Dietrich DR, Puddick J (2014) Costs of harmful blooms of freshwater
143 cyanobacteria. Chapter 15 in: Sharma, NK Ashwani, K, Stal, LJ Eds. *Cyanobacteria: An Economic
144 Perspective*. J Wiley and Sons 247-246
- 145 Han Y, Fan Y, Yang P, Wang X, Wang Y, Tiane J, Xu L, Wang C (2014) Net anthropogenic nitrogen
146 inputs (NANI) index application in Mainland China. *Geoderm* 213:87–94
- 147 Haumann D, Waite, TD (1978) The kinetics of phosphorus removal in small alkaline lakes by natural
148 and artificial processes. *Wat Soil Air Poll* 10:291-313
- 149 Hickey CW, Gibbs MM (2009) Lake sediment phosphorus release management – decision support
150 and risk assessment framework. *NZ J Mar Freshw Res* 43:819-856
- 151 Ho G, Matthew K (1993) Phosphorus removal using bauxite refining residue (red mud). *Aust Water
152 Waste water Assoc 15th Fed Conv* 607-613
- 153 Howarth R, Paerl HW (2008) Coastal marine eutrophication: Control of both nitrogen and phosphorus
154 is necessary. *Proceed Nat Acad Sci USA* 105, E103
- 155 Hsu PH (1989) Aluminum Oxides and Oxyhydroxides, In (Ed. Dixon, JB, Weed, SB), *Minerals in
156 Soil Environments*, Ch. 7 331-378.
- 157 Huang WY, Li D, Liu ZQ, Yang J, Zhan, Y (2014) Kinetics, isotherm, thermodynamic, and adsorption
158 mechanism studies of LaOH₃-modified exfoliated vermiculites as highly efficient phosphate
159 adsorbents. *Chem Eng J* 236:191-201
- 160 Huser BJ, Bajer PG, Chizinski CJ, Sorensen PW, (2015) Effects of common carp (*Cyprinus carpio*) on
161 sediment mixing depth and mobile phosphorus mass in the active sediment layer of a shallow lake.
162 *Hydrobiol* (in press)
- 163 Jack PN, Platell N (1983) Phosphorus adsorption by limestone. Potential for Harvey River inputs to
164 Harvey Estuary. *West Aust Govt Chem Lab* 7 pp
- 165 Jaouadi S, Wahab MA, Anane M, Bousselmi L, Jellali S (2014) Powdered marble wastes resue as a
166 low-cost material for phosphorus removal from aqueous solutions under dynamic conditions.
167 *Desal Wat Treat* 52:1705-1715
- 168 Jarvie HP, Sharpley AN, Spears BM, Buda AR, May L, Kleinman PJA (2013) Water quality
169 remediation faces unprecedented challenges from Legacy Phosphorus. *Env Sci Technol* 47:8997-
170 8998
- 171 JNCC (2005) Common Standards Monitoring Guidance for Freshwater Habitats and Species.1st
172 version- March 2005, ISSN 1743-8160.Joint Nature Conservation Committee
- 173 Jensen HS, Reitzel K, Egemose S (2015) Evaluation of aluminium treatment efficiency on water
174 quality and internal phosphorus cycling in siz Danish lakes. *Hydrobiol* 751:189-199
- 175 Jeppesen EM, Sondergaard JP, Jensen KE, Havens O, Anneville L, Carvalho MF, Coveney R, Deneke
176 MT, Dokulil B, Foy, D. Gerdeaux SE, Hampton S, Hilt K, Kangur J, Kohler E, Lammens TL,
177 Lauridsen M, Manca MR, Miracle B, Moss P, Noges G, Persson G, Phillips R, Portielje CL,
178 Schelske D, Straile I, Tatrai E, Willen M, Winder (2005) Lake responses to reduced nutrient
179 loading-an analysis of contemporary long-term data from 35 case studies.*Freshw Biol* 50:1747-
180 1771

-
- 181 Jernalov A (1971). Phosphate Reduction in Lakes by precipitation with Aluminium Sulphate. 5th
182 Inter. Wat. Poll. Res. Conf. Pergamon Press, New York
- 183 Johansson L, Renman G, Carlstrom H (1995) Light expanded clay aggregates LECA as reactive filter
184 medium in constructed wetlands. Proc. Ecotechnics 95 – Intl Symp Ecol Eng 214-224
- 185 Johansson L (1999) Blast furnace slag as phosphorus sorbents – column studies. Sci Tot Env 229:89-
186 97
- 187 Johansson L, Gustaffson JP (2000) Phosphate removal using blast furnace slags and opoka-
188 mechanisms. Wat Res 34:259-265
- 189 Kaneko S, Nakajimi K (1988). Phosphorus removal by crystallization using a granular activated
190 magnesia clinker. J. Wat. Poll. Cont Fed. 60:1239-1244
- 191 Karaca S, Gurses A, Ejder M, Acikyildiz M (2006) Adsorptive removal of phosphate from aqueous
192 solutions using raw and calcinated dolomite. J Haz Mat 128:273-279
- 193 Kim D, Ryoo KS, Hong Y.P, Choi, JH (2014) Evaluation of loess capability for adsorption of total
194 nitrogen t-n and total phosphorus t-p_ in aqueous solution. Bull Kor Chem Soc 35:2471-2476
- 195 Klauber C, Gräfe M, Power G. (2009) Review of bauxite residue re-use options. CSIRO Minerals,
196 Waterford, West Aust 77 pp
- 197 Kolzau S, Wiedner C, Rucker J, Kohler J, Kohler A, Dolman AM (2014) Seasonal patterns of
198 nitrogen and phosphorus limitation in four German lakes and the predictability of limitation status
199 from ambient nutrient concentrations. PLoS ONE 9
- 200 Lewis Jr WM, Wurtsbaugh WA, Paerl, HW (2011) Rationale for control of anthropogenic nitrogen
201 and phosphorus to reduce eutrophication to inland waters. Env Sci Technol 45:10300-10305
- 202 Lu J, Liu H, Zhao X, Jefferson W, Cheng F, Qu J (2014) Phosphate removal from water using freshly
203 formed Fe-Mn binary oxide: adsorption behaviours and mechanisms. Coll Surf A: Physicochem
204 Eng Asp 455:11-18
- 205 Lu J, Wang Z, Lu S, Wu, D (2014) Removal and recovery of phosphate from water by lanthanum
206 hydroxide materials. Chem Eng J 254:163-170
- 207 Lund, JWG (1955) The ecology of algae and waterworks practice. Proc Soc Wat Treat Exam 4:83-
208 109
- 209 Lürling M, Tolman Y (2010) Effects of lanthanum and lanthanum-modified clay on growth, survival
210 and reproduction of *Daphnia magna*. Wat Res 44:309-319
- 211 Lürling M, Faasen, EJ (2012) Controlling toxic cyanobacteria: Effects of dredging and phosphorus-
212 binding clay on cyanobacteria and microcystins. Wat Res 46:1447-1459
- 213 Lürling M, Engels B, Waajen G, van Zanten H, Turlings L (2012) Bestrijding Blauwalgenoverlast.
214 STOWA report (2012-42, ISBN 978.90.5773.575.2, www.stowa.nl
- 215 Lürling M, Van Oosterhout F (2013) Case study on the efficacy of a lanthanum-enriched clay
216 (Phoslock®) in controlling eutrophication in Lake Het GroeneEiland (The Netherlands). Hydrobiol
217 710:253-263
- 218 Lürling M, Van Oosterhout F (2013) Controlling eutrophication by combined bloom precipitation and
219 sediment phosphorus inactivation. Wat Res 47:6527-6537
- 220 Lürling M, Van Oosterhout, F, Waajen G (2014) Humic substances interfere with phosphate removal
221 by lanthanum modified clay in controlling eutrophication. Wat Res 54:78-88
- 222 LWRRDC (1998) Evaluation of the Impact of Research Projects Relating to Australia's Natural
223 Resources. Occasional Paper Land and Water Resources Research and Development Corporation,
224 Canberra, Australia.No. IR 01/99

-
- 225 Ma J, Qin B, Wu P, Zhou J, Niu C, Deng J, Niu H (2015) Controlling cyanobacterial blooms by
226 managing nutrient ratio and limitation in a large hyper-eutrophic lake: Lake Taihu, China. *J Env*
227 *Sci* 27, 80-86
- 228 Mackay EB, Maberly CS, Gang P, Reitzel K, Bruere A, Corker N, Douglas G, Egemose S, Hamilton
229 D, Hatton-Ellis T, Huser B, Li W, Meis S, Moss B, Lüring M, Phillips G, Yasseri S, Spears BM
230 (2014) Geoengineering in lakes: welcome attraction or fatal distraction? *Inland Waters* 4:349-356
- 231 Mann RA, and Bavor HJ (1993) Phosphorus removal in constructed wetlands using gravel and
232 industrial waste substrata. *Wat Sci Tech* 27:107-113
- 233 Marsden S (1989) Lake restoration by reducing external phosphorus loading: the influence of
234 sediment phosphorus release. *Freshw Biol* 21:139-162
- 235 Mateus DMR, Vaz MFN, and Pinho HJO (2012) Fragmented limestone wastes as a constructed
236 wetland substrate for phosphorus removal. *Ecol Eng* 41:65-69
- 237 Mattson MD (2015) Managing phosphorus loads from agricultural cranberry bogs to restore White
238 Island Pond. *Lake Reserv Manag* 31
- 239 Meis S, Spears BM, Maberly S, Perkins R (2011) Sediment amendment with Phoslock® in Clatto
240 Reservoir Dundee, UK: investigating spatial distribution & impacts on sediment phosphorus
241 binding capacity. *J Env Manag* 931:185-193
- 242 Moro T, Kunito T, Sato T (2015) Assessment of phosphorus bioavailability in cultivated Andisols
243 from a long-term fertilization field experiment using chemical extractions and soil enzyme
244 activities. *Archiv Agro Soil Sci* 61:1107-1123
- 245 Misra C, Perrotta AJ (1992) Composition and properties of synthetic hydrotalcites. *Clay Clay Min*
246 40:145-150.
- 247 Miyata S (1980) Physico-chemical properties of synthetic hydrotalcites in relation to composition.
248 *Clay Clay Min* 28:50-56
- 249 Miyata S (1980) Physico-chemical properties of synthetic hydrotalcites in relation to composition.
250 *Clay Clay Min* 28:50-56
- 251 Miyata S (1983) Anion-exchange properties of hydrotalcite-like compounds. *Clay Clay Min* 31:305-
252 311
- 253 Moss B, Jeppsen E, Sondergaard M, Lauridsen TL, Liu Z (2013) Nitrogen, macrophytes, shallow
254 lakes and nutrient limitation: Resolution of a current controversy? *Hydrobiol* 744:255-269
- 255 Muhid P, Burford MA (2012) Assessing nutrient limitation in a subtropical reservoir. *Inland Wat*
256 2:185-192
- 257 Muller S, Mitrovic SM (2014) Phytoplankton co-limitation by nitrogen and phosphorus in a shallow
258 reservoir: progressing from the phosphorus limitation paradigm. *Hydrobiol* 710:3-21
- 259 Nikolai SJ, Dzialowski AR (2014) Effects of internal phosphorus loading on nutrient limitation in a
260 eutrophic reservoir. *Limnologica* 49:33-41.
- 261 Ning P, Bart HJ, Li B, Lu X, Zhang Y (2008) Phosphate removal from wastewater by model-LaIII
262 zeolite adsorbents. *J Env Sci* 20:670-674
- 263 Nogaro G, Mermillod-Blondin F, Francois-Carcaillet F, Gaudet JP, Lafont M, Gibert J (2006)
264 Invertebrate bioturbation can reduce the clogging of sediment: an experimental study using
265 infiltration sediment columns. *Freshw Biol* 51:1458-1473
- 266 Nogaro G, Burgin AJ, Schoepfer VA, Konkler MJ, Bowman KL, Hammerschmidt CR (2013)
267 Aluminumsulfate (alum) application interactions with coupled metal and nutrient cycling in a
268 hypereutrophic lake ecosystem. *Env Pollut* 176:267-274
- 269 NOTOX (1995) Report *Daphnia magna*, reproduction test with lanthanum (La). NOTOX B.V.s
270 Hertogenbosch, The Netherlands, NOTOX Project 139499, NOTOX substance 47178

-
- 271 Norrish K, Rosser, H (1983) Mineral Phosphates. In (Ed. CSIRO Div. Soils).Soils: An Australian
272 viewpoint. 335-361
- 273 Noyma N, de Magalhães L, Lima Furtado L, Mucci M, van Oosterhout F, Huszar VLM,
274 ManziMarinho M and Lüring M (in press). Controlling cyanobacterial blooms through effective
275 flocculation and sedimentation with combined use of flocculents and phosphorus adsorbing natural
276 soil and modified clay. *Wat Res* xx:xxx-xxx
- 277 Oliveira M, Machado AV (2013) The role of phosphorus on eutrophication: a historical review and
278 future perspectives. *Env Technol Rev* 2:117-127
- 279 Özkundakci D, Hamilton DP, Scholes P (2010) Effect of intensive catchment and in-lake restoration
280 procedures on phosphorus concentrations in a eutrophic lake. *Ecol Eng* 36:396–405
- 281 Paerl HW, Xu H, McCarthy MJ, Zhu G, Qin B, Li Y, Gardner WS (2011). Controlling harmful
282 cyanobacterial blooms in a hyper-eutrophic lake LakeTaihu, China: The need for a dual nutrient N
283 & P management strategy. *Wat Res* 45:1973-1983
- 284 Paerl HW, Gardner WS, McCarthy MJ, Peierls BL, Wilhelm SW (2014) Algal blooms: Noteworthy
285 nitrogen. *Science* 346:175
- 286 Pan G, Zou H, Chen H, Yuan X (2006) Removal of harmful cyanobacterial blooms in Taihu Lake
287 using local soils III. Factors affecting the removal efficiency and an in situ field experiment using
288 chitosan-modified local soils. *Env Pollut* 141:206-212
- 289 Pan G, et al (2011) In-lake algal bloom removal and submerged vegetation restoration using modified
290 local soils, *Ecol Eng* 37:302-308
- 291 Pan G, Chen J, Anderson DM (2011) Modified local sands for the mitigation of harmful algal
292 blooms.*Harmful Algae* 10:381-387
- 293 Pan G, Dai L, Li L, He L, Li H, Bi L, Gulati RD (2012) Reducing the recruitment of sedimented algae
294 and nutrient release into the overlying water using modified soil/sand flocculation-capping in
295 eutrophic lakes. *Env Sci Technol* 46:5077–5084
- 296 Pan G, Krom MD, Zhang M, Zhang X, Wang L, Dai L, Sheng Y, Mortimer, RJG (2013) Impact of
297 suspended inorganic particles on phosphorus cycling in the Yellow River (China), *Env Sci*
298 *Technol* 47:9685–9692
- 299 Pan G, Krom MD, Herut B. (2002) Adsorption-Desorption of Phosphate on Airborne Dust and
300 Riverborne Particulates in East Mediterranean Seawater, *Env Sci Technol* 36:3519-3524
- 301 Parfitt RL, Hart PBS, Meyrick KF, Russell M (1982) Response of ryegrass and white clover to
302 phosphorus on an allophonic soil, Egmont black loam. *NZ J Agric Res* 25:549-555
- 303 Parfitt RL, Hume LJ, Sparling GP (1989) Loss of availability of phosphorus in New Zealand soils. *J*
304 *Soil Sci* 40:371-382
- 305 Patterson MJ, Schindler DW, Hecky RE, Findlay DL, Rondeau KJ (2011) Comment: Lake 227 shows
306 clearly that controlling inputs of nitrogen will not reduce or prevent eutrophication of lakes.
307 *Limnol Oceanog* 56:1545–1547
- 308 Polkane S, Portielje, R, ven den Berg M, Phillips P, Brucet S, Carvalho L, Mischke U, Ott I, Soska
309 H, Van Wichelen J (2014) Defining ecologically relevant water quality targets for lakes in
310 Europe.*Journal of Appl Ecol* 51, 592-602
- 311 Poikane S, Birk S, Böhmer J, Carvalho L, de Hoyos C, Gassner H, Hellsten S, Kelly M,
312 LycheSolheim A, Olin M, Pall K, Phillips G, Portielje R, Ritterbusch D, Sandin L, Schartau AK,
313 Solimini AG, van den Berg M, Wolfram G, van de Bund W (2015) A hitchhiker's guide to
314 European lake ecological assessment and intercalibration. *Ecol Ind* 520:533-544
- 315 Pontikes Y, Angelopoulos GN (2013) Bauxite residue in cement and cementitious applications:
316 Current status and a possible way forward. *Res Conserv Recycl* 73:53–63

- 317 Prepas EE, Murphy TM, Crosby JM, Walty D, T Lim JT, Babin J, Chambers PA (1990) Reductions
318 of phosphorus and chlorophyll a concentrations following CaCO_3 and Ca(OH)_2 additions to
319 hypereutrophic Figure Eight lake, Alberta. *Env Sci Technol* 24:1252-1258
- 320 Pretty JN, Mason CF, Nedwell DB, Hine RE, and Dils R (2003) Environmental costs of freshwater
321 eutrophication on England and Wales. *Env Sci Technol* 37:201-208.
- 322 Proctor DM, Fehling KA, Shay EC, Wittenborn JL, Green JJ, Avent C, Bigham RD, Connolly M, Lee
323 B, Shepker TO, Zak, MA (2000) Physical and chemical characteristics of blast furnace, basic
324 oxygen furnace, and electric arc furnace steel industry slags. *Env. Sci. Tech.* 34:1576-1582
- 325 Reardon EJ, Della Valle S (1997) Anion sequestering by the formation of anionic clays: lime
326 treatment of fly ash slurries. *Env Sci Technol* 31:1218-1223
- 327 Reitzel K, Andersen FØ, Egemose S, Jensen HS (2013), Phosphate adsorption by lanthanum modified
328 bentonite clay in fresh and brackish water. *Wat Res* 47:2787-2796
- 329 Reitzel K, Lotter S, Dubke M, Egemose S, Jensen HS, Andersen FØ, (2012) Effects of Phoslock®
330 treatment and chironomids on the exchange of nutrients between sediment and water. *Hydrobiol*
331 703:189-202
- 332 Reitzel K, Jensen HS, Egemose S (2013) pH dependent dissolution of sediment aluminum in six
333 Danish lakes treated with aluminium. *Wat Res* 47:1409-1420
- 334 Ripl W (1976) Biochemical oxidation of polluted lake sediment with nitrate. A new restoration
335 method. *Ambio* 5:312-315
- 336 Ripl W, Lindwark, G (1978) Ecosystem control by nitrogen metabolism in sediment. *Vatten*, 34:135-
337 144
- 338 Ripl W (1994) Sediment Treatment. In: Eiseltova, M. (Ed.). *Restoration of Lakes Ecosystems - A*
339 *Holistic Approach. Inland Waterfowl Wetland Res Bur* 32:75-81
- 340 Robb MR, Greenop B, Goss Z, Douglas GB, Adeney JA (2003) Application of Phoslock™, an
341 innovative phosphorus binding clay, to two Western Australian waterways – preliminary findings.
342 *Hydrol Proc* 494:237-243
- 343 Roques H, Nugroho-Juedy L, Lebugle A (1991). Phosphorus removal from wastewater by half-burned
344 dolomite. *Wat Res* 25:959-965
- 345 Rydin E, Huser B, Welch, EB (2000). Amount of phosphorus inactivated by alum treatments in
346 Washington lakes. *Limnol Oceanog* 45:226-230
- 347 Sakadevan K, Bavor, HJ (1998) Phosphate adsorption characteristics of soils, slags and zeolite to be
348 used as substrates in constructed wetland systems. *Wat Res* 32:393-399
- 349 Schindler DW, Hecky RE, Findlay DL, Stainton MP, Parker BR, Paterson MJ, Beaty KG, Lyng M,
350 Kaisan, SEM (2008) Eutrophication of lakes cannot be controlled by reducing nitrogen input:
351 Results of a 37-year whole-ecosystem experiment. *Proceed Nat Acad Sci USA* 105:11254-11258
- 352 Schindler DW, (2008) The dilemma of controlling cultural eutrophication in lakes. *Proceed Royal Soc*
353 *B: Biol Sci* 279:4322-4333
- 354 Scott JT, McCarthy MJ (2010) Nitrogen fixation may not balance the nitrogen pool in lakes over
355 timescales relevant to eutrophication management. *Limnol Oceanog* 55:1265–1270
- 356 Seida Y, Nakano Y (2000) Removal of humic substances by layered double hydroxide containing
357 iron. *Wat Res* 34:1487-1494
- 358 Sharpley A, Jarvie HP, Buda A, May L, Spears B, Kleinman, P (2013) Phosphorus legacy:
359 Overcoming the effects of past management practices to mitigate future water quality impairment.
360 *J Env Qual* 42:1308–1326
- 361 Shi WQ, Tan WQ, Wang LJ, Pan G (2015) Removal of microcystis aeruginosa using cationic starch
362 modified soils, *Wat Res* 2015, DOI:10.1016/j.watres.2015.06.029

-
- 363 Shilton A, Pratt S, Drizo A, Mahmood B, Banker S, Billings L, Glenny S, and Luo D (2005) Active
364 filters for upgrading phosphorus removal from pond systems. *Wat Sci Tech* 51:111-116
- 365 Shin HS, Kim MJ, Nam, SY, Moon HC (1996) Phosphorus removal by hydrotalcite compounds
366 (HTLcs). *Wat Sci Tech* 34:161-168
- 367 Smith VH (2003) Eutrophication of freshwater and coastal marine ecosystems: a global problem. *Env*
368 *Sci Pollut Res* 10:126-139
- 369 Sneller FEC, Kalf DF, Weltje L, van Wezel AP (2000) Maximum permissible concentrations and
370 negligible concentrations for rare earth elements (REEs). RIVM report 601501011
- 371 Søndergaard M, Jeppesen E, Jensen JP (2000) Hypolimnetic nitrate treatment to reduce internal
372 phosphorus loading in a stratified lake. *Lake Res Manag* 16: 195-204
- 373 Spears BM, Dudley B, Reitzel K, Rydin E (2013) Geo-engineering in lakes: a call for consensus. *Env*
374 *Sci Technol* 47:3953-3954
- 375 Spears BM, Meis S, Anderson A, Kellou M (2013) Comparison of phosphorus P removal properties
376 of materials proposed for the control of sediment P release in UK lakes. *Sci Tot Env* 442:103-110
- 377 Spears, B.M M. Lürling, S. Yasseri, A.T Castro-Castellon, M. Gibbs, S. Meis, C. McDonald, J.
378 McIntosh, D. Sleep, F. Van Oosterhout. (2013) Lake responses following lanthanum-modified
379 bentonite clay Phoslock® application: an analysis of water column lanthanum data from 16 case
380 study lakes. *Wat Res* 47:5930-42
- 381 Spears BM, Maberly SC (2014) Lessons learned from geoengineering freshwater systems. *Nat Clim*
382 *Change* 4, 935-936
- 383 Stauber JL (2000) Toxicity testing of modified clay leachates using freshwater organisms. CSIRO
384 Centre for Advanced Analytical Chemistry Energy Technology. Report no. ETIR267R. Prepared
385 for CSIRO Land and Water.
- 386 Stauber JL, Binet MT (2000) Canning River Phoslock Field Trial – Ecotoxicology Testing Final
387 Report. CSIRO & the WA Waters and Rivers Commission
- 388 Suzuki M, Fuji T (1988) Simultaneous removal of phosphate and ammonium ions from wastewater by
389 composite adsorbent. *Proc. Wat. Pollut. Control in Asia*, pp. 239-245
- 390 Takeuchi M, Komada M (1998) Phosphorus removal from hoggery sewage using natural calcium
391 carbonate. *Jap. Agric. Res. Qtly.*32:23-30.
- 392 Taylor RM (1984). The rapid formation of crystalline double hydroxy salts and other compounds by
393 controlled hydrolysis. *Clay Min.* 19:591-603
- 394 Theng BKG, Russell M, Churchman GJ, Parfitt RL (1982) Surface properties of allophane, halloysite
395 and imogolite. *Clays Clay Min* 30:143-149
- 396 Thornber MR, Hughes CA (1987) The mineralogical and chemical properties of red mud waste from
397 the Western Australian alumina industry. In Wagh, AS and Desai, P Ed *Proc. Int. Conf. Bauxite*
398 *Tailings*, Kingston, Jamaica. 1-19
- 399 Trochine C, Guerrieri ME, Lioriussen L, Lauridsen TL, Jeppesen E (2014) Effects of nutrient
400 loading, temperature regime and grazing pressure on nutrient limitation of periphyton in
401 experimental ponds. *Freshw Biol* 59:905-917
- 402 USEPA, (2015) Preventing eutrophication: scientific support for dual nutrient criteria. Office of
403 Water, US Environmental Protection Agency 820-S-15-001.6 pp
- 404 Van Oosterhout, F Lürling, M (2011) Effects of the novel ‘Flock & Lock’ lake restoration technique
405 on *Daphnia* in Lake Rauwbraken (The Netherlands). *J Plankt Res* 33:255–263
- 406 Van Oosterhout F, Lürling, M (2013) The effect of phosphorus binding clay (Phoslock®) in
407 mitigating cyanobacterial nuisance: a laboratory study on the effects on water quality variables and
408 plankton. *Hydrobiologia* 710:265-277

-
- 409 Vohla C, Koiv M, Bavor J, Chazarenc F, Mander U (2011) Filter materials for phosphorus removal
410 from wastewater in treatment wetlands – A review. *Ecol Eng* 37:70-89
- 411 Vucelic M, Jones W, Moggridge GD (1997) Cation ordering in synthetic layered double hydroxides.
412 *Clays Clay Min.* 45, 803-813
- 413 Waajen G, Van Oosterhout F, Douglas G, Lüring M (2015) Management of eutrophication in Lake
414 De Kuil (The Netherlands) using combined flocculant - lanthanum modified bentonite treatment.
415 *Wat Res* doi:10.1016/j.watres2015.11.034
- 416 Wada K (1959) Reaction of phosphate with allophane and halloysite. *Soil Sci.* 87:325-330
- 417 Wada K (1980) Mineralogical characteristics of Andosols. In (Ed Theng, BKG), *Soils with variable*
418 *charge.* *NZ Soil Sci Soc* 87-107
- 419 Wada K (1989) Allophane and imogolite. In Eds. Dixon JB, Weed SB *Minerals in soil environments*
420 1051-1087
- 421 Wang S, Ang HM, Tade MO (2008) Novel application of red mud as coagulant, absorbent and
422 catalyst for environmentally benign processes. *Chemos* 72:1621-1635
- 423 Wang ZB, Zhang HG, Pan G (2015) Ecotoxicological assessment of flocculant modified soil for lake
424 restoration using an integrated biotic toxicity index, *Wat Res* DOI: 10.1016/j.watres.(2015.08.033
- 425 Welch EB, Battebo SK, Gibbons HL, Plotnikoff RW (2015) A dramatic recovery of Lake Spokane
426 water quality following wastewater phosphorus reduction. *Lake Res Manag* 31:157-165
- 427 Wendling LA, Douglas GB, Coleman S (2012) Productive use of steelmaking by-product in
428 environmental applications: II. Leachate geochemistry, ecotoxicity and environmental
429 radioactivity. *Min Eng* 39:219-227
- 430 Wendling LA, Douglas GB, Coleman S Yuan Z (2012) Nutrient and dissolved organic carbon
431 removal from water using mining and metallurgical by-products. *Wat Res*, 46:2705-2717
- 432 Wendling LA, Douglas GB, Coleman S, Yuan Z (2013) Nutrient and dissolved organic carbon
433 removal from natural waters using industrial by-products. *Sci Tot Env* 442:63-72
- 434 Wolter, KD (1984) Phosphorus precipitation. In: Eiseltova, M. (Ed.). *Restoration of Lakes Ecosystems*
435 *- A Holistic Approach.* *Inland Waterfowl and Wetland Res Bur* 32:63-68
- 436 World Health Organization WHO (2008) *World Health Organization WHO Guidelines for water*
437 *quality, Vol 1, 3rd edition incorporating 1st and 2nd addenda* World Health Organization, Geneva,
438 Switzerland (2008)
- 439 Xu H, Paerl HW, Qin B, Zhu G, Hall NS, Wu Y (2015) Determining critical nutrient thresholds
440 needed to control harmful cyanobacterial blooms in eutrophic Lake Taihu, China. *Env Sci Tech*
441 49:1051-1059
- 442 Xu N, Chen M, Zhou K, Wang Y, Yin H, Chen Z (2014) Retention of phosphorus on calcite and
443 dolomite: Speciation and modelling. *RSC Adv* 4:35205-35214
- 444 Yamada H, Kayama M, Saito K, Hara M (1986) A fundamental research on phosphate removal using
445 slag. *Wat Res* 20:547-557
- 446 Yamada H, Kayama M, Saito K, Hara M (1987) Suppression of phosphate liberation from sediment
447 by using iron slag. *Wat Res* 21:325-333
- 448 Yamada TM, Sueitt APE, Beraldo DAS, Botta CMR, Fadini PS, Nascimento MRL, Faria BM,
449 Mozeto AA (2012). Calcium nitrate addition to control the internal load of phosphorus from
450 sediments of a tropical eutrophic reservoir: Microcosm experiments. *Wat Res* 46:6463-6475
- 451 Yang K, Yan LG, Yang YM, Yu S, -J Shan RR, Yu HQ, Zhu BC, Du B (2014) Adsorptive removal of
452 phosphate by Mg-Al and Zn-Al layered double hydroxides: kinetics, isotherms and mechanisms.
453 *Sep Purif Tech* 124:36-42

-
- 454 Yin H, Kong M, Fan C (2013) Batch investigations on P immobilization from wastewaters and
455 sediment using natural calcium rich sepiolite as a reactive material. *Wat Res* 47:4247-4258
- 456 Yuan XZ, Pan G, Chen H, Tian .H (2009) Phosphorus fixation in lake sediments using LaCl₃-
457 modified clays, *Ecol Eng* 35:1599-1602
- 458 Yuan YT, Zhang HG, Pan G (2015) Flocculation of Cyanobacterial Cells Using Coal Fly Ash
459 Modified Chitosan. *Water Res.* 2015. DOI: 10.1016/j.watres.2015.12.003
- 460 Zamparas M, Drosos M, Georgiou Y, Deligiannakis Y, Zacharias I (2013) A novel bentonite-humic
461 acid composite material Bephos™ for removal of phosphate and ammonium from eutrophic
462 waters. *Chem Eng J* 225:43–51
- 463 Zamparas M, Zacharias I (2014) Restoration of eutrophic freshwater by managing internal nutrient
464 loads. *Sci Tot Env*, 496:551-562
- 465 Zhu T, Jenssen PD, Mæhlum T, Krogstad T (1997) Phosphorus sorption and chemical characteristics
466 of lightweight aggregates LWA – potential filter media in treatment wetlands. *Wat Sci Tech*
467 35:103-108
- 468 Zhu T (1998) Phosphorus and nitrogen removal in light-weight aggregate (LWA) constructed
469 wetlands and intermittent filter systems. DSc Thesis, Agric. Univ. Norway.